Document ID: CO-OAD.FO.005



Republic of the Philippines

Department of Environment and Natural Resources

OFFICE: OAD, IAS CONTROL NO.:

AFS.CO-IAS-OAD.2021.021

DATE GIVEN: 21 July 2021 TARGET RESPONSE DATE:

30 July 2021

AUDIT FINDING SHEET ON NATIONAL GREENING PROGRAM (NGP) REGION 4B – MIMAROPA

PREPARED BY:

THOM CEDRICK Q. FERNANDO Internal Auditor II

ENGR. JARVIS L. VALENCIA Engineer III RUBEN G. DIEGOR
Development Management Officer II

JOHN PAUL T HAYLO

Internal Auditor I

EMMYLOU S. PUERTA Internal Auditing Assistant

JAMES ALVIC DELMIER C. BALOTO Senior Forest Management Specialist

REVIEWED BY:

Makel F. COLOMA

OIC Chief, Operations Audit Division

APPROVED BY:

GAVIN D. EDJAWAN, MNSA

Interim Director, Internal Audit Service

As per the Performance Audit on National Greening Program (NGP), we found the below-listed gap/deficiency. Please complete the section "Root Cause" to identify the cause of the control weakness; and the section "Remarks" which is the response to the indicated gap and/or brief description of action plan/taken. Please return this form with Means of Verification (MOVs) to the Operations Audit Division (OAD) on or before the target response date.

AREA	REFERENCE NO.	AUDITEE
MAINTENANCE AND PROTECTION (Major Nonconformity)	R4B-POccMin-007	CENRO SABLAYAN, OCCIDENTAL MINDORO CENRO NGP Coordinator

CRITERIA

DENR Memorandum Circular No. 2013-06 Section 5. Responsibilities of Parties

Section 5.2 The Partner shall [...] Ensure at least 85% survival of established plantations; [...]

Memorandum of Agreement (PENRO Occidental Mindoro and Samahang Pagtatanim ng Punong Kahoy sa Malatongtong Burgos Occidental Mindoro, Inc.)

Comprehensive Site Development

5. General Undertakings

5.6 The NGP Partners commits to maintain at least eighty five percent (85%) survival on planted seedlings in the first year of NGP implementation.

CONDITION

BRGY. LIGAYA, SABLAYAN, OCCIDENTAL MINDORO (60 hectares)

1. As per Inspection Reports in the 1st year (09 February 2018) and 2nd year implementation (17 December 2018), the survival rate of the planted seedlings for the 60 hectares was 33.92% and 31%, respectively.

In the 3^{rd} year implementation, the survival rate for the 40 hectares only per Inspection Report dated 02 December 2019 was 85%. However, as per Validation Report for the release of the retention fund in 2020, the reported survival rate was 0%.

- Based on interview with the CENRO San Jose personnel who conducted the cross-validation in CENRO Sablayan, the survival rate of 0% was based on the parcel with 20 hectares. The parcel with 40 hectares was not included in the said validation. Furthermore, it was mentioned that only the sample plots located in the 20-hectare parcel were provided by the CENRO Sablayan NGP personnel.
- Further, as per interview with the Inspection and Acceptance Committee, they were not able to visit the 40 hectare-parcel with reported 85% survival rate. It was also mentioned that the Inspection Report was not prepared by the IAC members themselves, and was already signed by the higher authorities.

 Also, as indicated in the said Inspection Report, the actual validation on the NGP site was conducted on 27-28 November and 07 December 2019. However, the Report was already prepared and approved on 02 December 2019 while the actual validation was not yet completed.

(TO BE ACCOMPLISHED BY THE AUDITEE)		
ROOT CAUSE		
REMARKS (Explanation and Plan of Actions with Target Dates; or Action Taken)		
PROCESS OWNER (Responsible for Action)	NOTED BY	
	CAESAR E. QUEBEC	
ELLE MUÑEZ	CENRO, Sablayan	
ELLIE NUÑEZ CENRO NGP Coordinator		
526 115 555.3		
	ERNESTO E. TAÑADA	
	OIC PENRO, Occidental Mindoro	
Date Signed:	Date Signed:	