

# Republic of the Philippines DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PUERTO PRINCESA CITY

South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660

Email Address: <a href="mailto:cenropuertoprincesa@denr.gov.ph">cenropuertoprincesa@denr.gov.ph</a>

July 27, 2021

MR. RICHARD M. LOPEZ

Puerto Princesa City Mobile No. 09266291844

Dear Mr. Lopez,

Environmental greetings!!

This has reference to your request for permit to cut planted trees within the private property covering Lot No. 3784, Pls-1117-D located in Sitio Rubber, Brgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City.

Based on records, we already informed you several times to submit/settle first all the lacking documents/requirements and was informed of the inconsistencies of the documents you have submitted to us with regards to your request to cut trees planted within the said property per our letter to you which are listed hereunder.

- 1. Letter dated August 27, 2019 signed by CENRO In-Charge of Office Forester-III Rodney G. Verian informing you that your application for issuance of tree cutting permit/clearance has lacking requirements that needed to be submitted;
- 2. Letter January 23, 2020 signed by LMO-II Mildred A. Pascual as In-Charge of CENR Office informing you that the CENR Office sent you a letter dated August 27, 2019 thru Postal office in response to your letter dated August 5, 2019 and informing you further that your application for tree cutting permit has lacking requirements that needed to be submitted in order to facilitate the processing of your request;
- 3. Letter dated December 15, 2020 signed by CENRO Felizardo B. Cayatoc informing you that based on records, this office sent you a letter twice dated August 27, 2019 and January 23, 2020 and further informing you to submit the lacking requirements in order to facilitate the processing of your application and since the OCT is still in the name of Montano Calagok Bendanillo as per record of the DAR and the City Register of Deeds, in that case the Office required you to submit an authenticated copy of the Deed of Sale stating that the subject lot was already sold to you by the owner. However, you presented to this office two different Deed of Sale, first was the Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano Calagok Bendanillo and the second was the Deed of Sale dated September 27, 2017 executed by Joselito Lopez. Hence, you were given fifteen (15) days upon receipt of said letter to present the authenticated copy/s of said documents and to explain in writing the observed/noted abovementioned inconsistencies of information and the alleged insertions/erroneous in the document/s, otherwise your Tree Cutting Permit/Clearance will be automatically rejected/denied by this Office without prejudice to the refiling of the request for issuance of Tree Cutting Clearance/Permit;

- 4. December 22, 2020 letter signed by CENRO In-Charge of Office SEMS Ma. Vivian O Soriano advising you to submit a copy of Deed of Sale executed by Mr. Joselito Lopez duly authenticated by the Clerk of Court;
- 5. Letter dated January 22, 2021 informing you that per examination of the documents relative to your request for tree Cutting permit and other subsequent documents and information gathered by the office further disclosed that there are three (3) Deed of Sale issued by different individuals covering the subject lot and different SPA and GPA were executed by different individuals pertaining to the subject lot, hence you are requested to submit a copy of the Court Order or Decision as to the legality of the ownership over the subject lot so that the Office could issue the corresponding Tree Cutting Permit to the rightful individual/owner;
- 6. Letter dated March 11, 2021 signed by CENRO Felizardo B. Cayatoc informing you that the Office is firm in its decision per letter dated January 22, 2021 which is not to issue permit to cut trees until such time that you have presented a Court Order/Decision stating that you are the lawful owner of the lot where the trees requested to be cut are located:
- 7. Letter of the undersigned dated July 19, 2021 stating this Office is firm in its decision per previous letters dated January 22, 2021 and March 11, 2021 not to issue Permit to Cut Trees until such time that you have presented a Court Order/Decision stating that you are the lawful owner of the lot where the trees requested to be cut are located.

Relative thereto, we are reiterating our previous letters to you to please submit a copy of Court Order/Decision stating that you are the lawful owner of the subject lot where the trees you are requesting to be cut are located.

OPRINCESA

We trust that you are properly informed. Thank you.

Truly yours,

In-Charge, CENRO Puerto Princesa City

Copy furnished:

The Office of the Presidents 8888 Citizen's Complaint Center
 The RED, DENR-MIMAROPA Region
 The PENR Officer, DENR-PENRO, PPCity

4. file

August 27, 2019

#### MR. RICHARD LOPEZ

Pangobilian, Brooke's Point, Palawan 0945-779-9802/0908-276-1126

Dear Mr. Lopez:

Environmental greetings!

This has reference to your application for issuance of tree cutting permit/clearance of planted tree within private property located in Bgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City.

Please be informed that per review and evaluation of the previous submitted documents disclosed that there are still lacking documentary requirement that you need to submit to this Office, to wit:

- 1. Authenticated copy of TCT/OCT from Registry of Deeds;
- 2. Vicinity Map/Tax Map;
- 3. DAR Certification if the subject trees is within a parcel of land issued with Certificate of Land Ownership Award (CLOA);
- 4. Bgy. Certification interposing no objection to cut planted trees within the private property;
- 5. Authenticated copy of Deed of Absolut Sale;
- 6. Authenticated copy of Special Power of Attorney with attached copy of any Government Identification Card
- 7. DAR Cadastral Map showing the area and;
- 8. Authenticated copy of Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano G. Bendanillo with Simultaneous Deed of Absolute Sale and with attached copy of any Government Identification Card

Immediate submission/compliance of the above-mentioned requirement will facilitate the processing of the subject request.

Thank you and we trust that you are properly informed.

Very truly yours,

For and in the absence of CENR Officer:

RODNEY G VERIAN Forester HI/Chief, MES

Officer-In-Charge

The PENR Officer

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City

The Regional Executive Director DENR IV-B, MIMAROPA 1515 L&S Bldg., Roxas Blvd., Ermita, Manila

- Chief, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

Chief, Conservation and Development Section

File

7/01 8/18-19

of the same of the

3:25pm

January 23, 2020

#### MR. RICHARD LOPEZ

Pangobilian, Brooke's Point, Palawan +63 945-779-9802/ +63 908-276-1126

Sir:

Environmental greetings!

This has reference to your letter dated December 19, 2019 which was received by this Office on December 23, 2019 and letter dated August 05, 2019 regarding your request for inspection and tree inventory leading to the issuance of Certificate of Tree Plantation Ownership and tree cutting permit/clearance to cut planted trees of various species within private land located in Bgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City.

Please be informed that this Office sent you a letter dated August 27, 2019 with Postal Registry Receipt No. RD 994-410-240-ZZ in response to your letter dated August 05, 2019 which was received by this Office on the same date regarding the subject matter.

Likewise, per review/evaluation of the submitted documents supporting your application for Certificate of Tree Plantation Ownership (CTPO) and tree cutting permit shows that the following are needed to be complied, to wit:

- 1. Authenticated copy of TCT/OCT from Registry of Deeds;
- 2. Vicinity Map/Tax Map;
- 3. DAR Certification if the subject trees is within a parcel of land issued with Certificate of Land Ownership Award (CLOA);
- 4. Bgy. Certification interposing no objection to cut planted trees within the private property;
- 5. Authenticated copy of Deed of Absolut Sale;
- 6. Authenticated copy of Special Power of Attorney with attached copy of any Government Identification Card
- 7. DAR Cadastral Map showing the area and;
- 8. Authenticated copy of Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano G. Bendanillo with Simultaneous Deed of Absolute Sale and with attached copy of any Government Identification Card

Immediate submission/compliance of the above-mentioned requirements will facilitate the processing of your request and further endorsement at the Regional Office.

Very truly yours;

For and in the absence of CENRO:

MILDRED A. PASCUAL LMO II/Chief, RPS Office-In-Charge

1-20 · 70

The PENR Officer

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City

The Regional Executive Director DENR IV-B, MIMAROPA 1515 L&S Bldg., Roxas Blvd., Ermita, Manila

HON, LADDY R. GEMANG Punong Barangay Bgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City

Chief, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

File

Postmaster/Teller



#### DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES

### COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PUERTO PRINCESA CITY

South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660 Email Address: <a href="mailto:cenroppchuc@yahoo.com">cenroppchuc@yahoo.com</a>

December 15, 2020

MR. RICHARD M. LOPEZ

Brgy. Pangobilian Brooke's Point, Palawan Mobile No. 09266291844

Dear Mr. Lopez,

Total Plane Person De Palawan Records

Total 12/16/202

This pertains to your request for Tree Cutting Permit/Clearance to cut planted trees within the private property covered by OCT No. 94 with CLOA No. 00070814 identified as Lot No. 3784, Pls-1117-D containing an area of 13,185 square meters located in Brgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City. Requirement for the issuance TCP are the following:

- 1. Application letter/letter of intent;
- 2. Authenticated copy of the OCT/TCT from the Registry of Deeds;
- 3. DAR Certification (if the lot applied is DAR-CLOA);
- 4. Barangay Certification /Barangay endorsement (interposing no objection to cut trees);
- 5. Vicinity Map/Tax Map from Assessor's Office; and
- 6. Special Power of attorney (SPA)/Deed of Absolute Sale/PAMB Clearance

Records of this Office shows that a letter was sent to you twice dated August 27, 2019 and January 23, 2020 informing you to submit the lacking requirements in order to facilitate the processing of your application for Tree Cutting Permit /Clearance. The following documents were submitted from your end, and received, to wit:

- 1. Application letter dated February 27, 2016;
- 2. Authenticated copy of the OCT/TCT from the Registry of Deeds in the name of Montano Calagok Bendanillo;
- DAR Certification that Mr. Montano Calagok Bendanillo is the registered owner of OCT No. 94 with CLOA No. 00070814 identified as Lot No. 3784, Pls-1117-D containing an area of 13,185 square meters located at Brgy. Luzviminda, formerly part of Mangingisda, Puerto Princesa City;
- 4. Barangay Certification;
- 5. Tax Map from Assessor's Office for the Lot No. 3784 in the name of Montano Bendanillo:
- 6. Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano Calagok Bendanillo with simultaneous Deed of Absolute Sale and Special Power of Attorney executed by Romana R. Bendanillo Annie R. Repaso and Cresencio Repaso (Heirs of deceased Montano Calagok Bendanillo);
- Deed of Sale of a Parcel of Land with OCT No. 94 containing an area of 1.3185 hectares located in Brgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City executed by Mr. Joselito Lopez in your favor per GPA dated September 22, 2003

Since the OCT is still in the name of Montano Calagok Bendanillo as per records of the DAR and City Register of Deeds, in this case an authenticated copy of the Deed of Sale stating that the subject lot was already sold to you by the owner was required by this Office.

However, you have presented to this Office two different Deed of Sale, first was the Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano Calagok Bendanillo with Simultaneous Deed of Sale and Special Power of Attorney executed by Heirs of Montano Calagok Bendanillo dated February 12, 2016 wherein it was found that there are insertions and erasures of some information stated therein. It can be recalled that you were also required by this Office to submit another copy duly authenticated by the lawyer who notarized the said document, however upon submission of the alleged authenticated copy, we noticed that only the last page (page 3) was certified by Atty. Fernando Gomez (the notary public who notarized the said document) while the first and second pages of said Deed of Sale remained uncertified/unauthenticated.

Second was the Deed of Sale dated September 27, 2017 executed by Joselito Lopez using the General Power of Attorney (GPA) executed by his mother Mrs. Jocelyn Rolf-Harris the first buyer of the subject property from the original owner (Montano Calagok Bendanillo). We also noticed from the GPA executed by Mrs. Jocelyn Harris in favor of Mr. Joselito Lopez that the latter has no authority to sell the said property because as stated in the GPA, Mr. Joselito Lopez is only an administrator for business purposes in behalf of Mrs. Harris under the Jostar Trading & Construction. The private property covering OCT No. 94 located in Brgy. Luzviminda was not mentioned in the said GPA.

Due to the existence of these two documents as well as the observed/noted inconsistencies of the informations stated therein including those documents supporting the said Deed of Sales, you are hereby given fifteen (15) days upon receipt the herein letter to present the authenticated copy/s of said documents and to explain in writing the observed/noted abovementioned inconsistencies of information and the alleged insertions/erroneous in the document/s, otherwise your application for Tree Cutting Permit/Clearance will be automatically rejected/denied by this Office without prejudice to the refiling of the request for issuance of Tree Cutting Clearance/Permit.

We trust that you are properly informed.

Truly yours,

FELIZARDO B. CAYATOC
CENR Officer

cc. The PENRO, Palawan file



## DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PUERTO PRINCESA CITY

South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660 Email Address: <a href="mailto:cenroppchuc@yahoo.com">cenroppchuc@yahoo.com</a>

Ika-22 ng Disyembre, 2020

G. RICHARD M. LOPEZ

Brgy. Pangobilian Brooke's Point, Palawan Mobile No. 09266291844

G. Lopez,

Ito po ay patungkol sa inyong sulat na may petsang ika-15 ng Disyembre, 2020 bilang kasagutan sa aming liham sa inyo sa parehong petsa patungkol sa inyong kahilingan na mapagkalooban ng *permit/clearance* upang Maputol ang mga itinanim na puno ng Gmelina at Mahogany sa lupain na napapaloob sa OCT No. 94 na may CLOA No. 00070814, sukat na 13,185 metro kwadrado na matatagpuan sa Brgy. Luzviminda, Lungsod ng Puerto Princesa.

Kaugnay nito, kayo ay pinapayuhan na magsumite ng kopya ng *Deed of Sale* sa pagitan ninyo ni G. Joselito Lopez na may patotoo o *authenticated copy* (bawat pahina ng dokumento) na nagmumula sa *Clerk of Court*. Sapagkat ang inyong naisumite sa tanggapang ito ay *photo copy* lamang.

Umaasa kami na lubos ninyong naunawaan ang liham na ito at para magkaroon ng pinal na aksyon sa inyong kahilingan. Maraming salamat.

Ang inyong lingkod,

"Sa ngalan ng CENRO"

MA. VIVIAN O. SORIANC Sr. ECOMS/Chief CDS

Officer In-Charge

(b 29 (2-27-7)

pressed Mugas

January 22, 2021

Mr. Richard M. Lopez Brgy. Pangobilian, Brooke's Point, Palawan Cell No. 09266291844

Sir:

This has reference to your request for Tree Cutting Permit involving a parcel of land covered with Original Certificate of Title No. 94 and CLOA No. 00070814 more particularly described as Lot No. 3784, Pls-1117-D located in Barangay Luzviminda (formerly part of Mangingisda), Puerto Princesa City issued in the name of Montano Calagok Bendanillo registered on March 18, 1991.

Please be informed that examination of the documents relative to your request for Tree Cutting Permit and other subsequent documents and information gathered by the office further disclosed that there exist three (3) Deed of Sale issued by different individuals covering the subject lot, such as follows:

- On February 16, 1994, Mr. Montano Calagok Bendanillo executed a Deed of Sale in favor of Josie R. Harris and Cecilio Largado before Notary Public Enrique F. Javier, Jr. under Doc. No. 155; and Page No. 32;
- 2. On February 12, 2016, the sole heirs of the deceased Montano Calagok Bendanillo, namely Romana R. Bendanillo, widow and Annie R. Repaso married to Cresencio S. Repaso executed an Extrajudicial Settlement of Estate of Montano Calagok Bendanillo with Simultaneous Deed of Absolute Sale and Special Power of Attorney involving a parcel of land more particularly described as Lot No. 3784, Pls 1117-D located in Brgy. Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City under Doc No. 2089; Page No. 396; Book No. XVIII, Series of 2016. However, scrutiny of the said documents revealed that there are insertions and erasures of some information which led to the issuance of this office letter dated December 15, 2020;
- 3. On September 27, 2017, Joselito R. Lopez executed a Deed of Sale of a Parcel of Land involving Lot No. 3784, Pls 1117-D located I Barangay Luzviminda, Puerto Princesa City

Furthermore, different Special Power of Attorney (SPA) and General Power of Attorney (GPA) were executed by different individuals pertaining to the subject lot, to wit:

 On January 7, 1995, Josie Harris executed a Special Power of Attorney in favor of one Gavino Largado to be her true and lawful attorney-in-fact to manage and improve all her properties, residential and agricultural, located at Luzviminda Puerto Princesa City and at Panacan, Narra, Palawan including planting trees provided that Josie Harris will provide seedlings, Carabao and allowances or salary in favor of her attorney-in-fact;

> South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica Puerto Princesa City Email Address: <a href="mailto:cenroppchuc@yahoo.com">cenroppchuc@yahoo.com</a> Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660



Republic of the Philippines Department of Environment and Natural Resources Region IV - MIMAROPA

COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

- 2. On September 22, 2003, Jocelyn P. Rolf-Harris executed a General Power of Attorney (GPA) in favor of one Joselito R. Lopez to act as administrator of her business named JOSTAR TRADING & CONSTRUCTION with business address at No. 88 Villarosa Street, Puerto Princesa City xxx;
- 3. On November 26, 2010, again, Jocelyn P. Rolf-Harris executed a General Power of Attorney in favor of one Lailani Lopez to do and perform the following acts, things and deeds (1) To act as administrator of all her properties located in the whole Province of Palawan; (2) To follow-up, sign all necessary documents in relation with all her land acquisitions in the Province of Palawan; (3) Demand, get and receive all monetary collectibles with various persons whether in the form of cash or check; (4) To transact, make deposits with banks (BPI and BDO) where she maintain several accounts; and (5) To do and perform all other acts and deeds necessary to accomplish the objectives of the said instrument.

In view of the aforementioned circumstances, the fact that there exist three (3) deed of sale and three (3) General/Special Power of Attorney all submitted by different individuals pertaining to the subject lot wherein the determination of who has better rights and/or who has valid sale is beyond the capacity of the office to determine, hence, it is advised that you settle first the legal issues pertaining to the ownership of the subject lot by way of settling the matter in Court.

Be informed further that the same matter has been communicated with Ms. Lailani Lopez RN per letter of this office dated December 15, 2016. Copy of the said letter is hereto attached as Annex A.

Once settled, we are requesting that you submit a copy of the Court Order or Decision on the matter so that we could issue the corresponding Tree Cutting Permit to the rightful individual/owner.

Early settlement of the legality on the ownership over the subject lot will facilitate the processing of your request if found in order.

We trust that you are properly informed and understand the surrounding issues on the matter

ELIZARDO B. CAYATOC **CENR Officer** 

RE 412 106 716 ZZ 

onal Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica Puerto Princesa City

ress: cenroppchuc@yahoo.com Fax No.: (048) 433-0660

reference in case of inquiry

Postmaster/Teller

ost Office

Package No



## DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

PUERTO PRINCESA CITY

South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660

Email Address: cenropuertoprincesa@denr.gov.ph

March 11, 2021

Mr. Richard M. Lopez Brgy. Pangobilian

Brooke's Point, Palawan Mobile No. 09266291844

Dear Mr. Lopez,

This is to acknowledge receipt of your letter dated March 3, 2021 which was received by this Office yesterday March 10, 2021 attaching the Memorandum dated February 15, 2021 of PENRO Eriberto B. Saños, *CESE* relative to your request to expedite issuance of permit to cut trees pending before this Office.

Please be informed that on January 22, 2021 this Office sent you a letter wherein you have personally received on the same day stating vis-à-vis the reasons why your application is pending in this Office and further advised you to settle first the legal issues pertaining to the ownership of the lot by way of settling the matter in the proper Court (attached is copy of said letter).

Relative thereto, this Office is firm in our decision stated to our letter dated January 22, 2021 not to issue Permit to Cut Trees until such time that you have presented a Court Order/Decision stating that you are the lawful owner of the lot where the trees requested to be cut are located.

We trust that you are properly informed.

Copy furnished:

- The PENR Officer DENR-PENRO, Sta. Monica, PPC

- file

Truly yours,

FELIZARDO B. CAYATOC

CENR Officer

a.

The ment with



#### DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

PUERTO PRINCESA CITY

South National Highway, Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City Tel Fax No.: (048) 433-0660 Email Address: cenroppchuc@yahoo.com

July 19, 2021

MR. RICHARDM. LOPEZ

Puerto Princesa City Mobile No. 09266291844

Dear Mr. Lopez,

Environmental greetings!!

This is to acknowledge receipt of your letter dated July 15, 2021 submitting a photocopy of "Kasunduan" between you and Mr. Gavino M. Largado, the caretaker of land with Lot No. 3784, Pls-1117-D located in Sitio Rubber, Brgy. Luzviminda, this City that according to your letter for the issuance of permit to cut planted trees.

Please be informed that this Office is firm in our decision stated to our previous letters dated January 22, 2021 and March 11, 2021 not to issue Permit to Cut Trees until such time that you have presented a Court Order/Decision stating that you are the lawful owner of the lot where the trees requested to be cut are located.

We trust that you are properly informed. Thank you.

read his

Truly yours,

DMO IV PEDRO A. VELASCO

In-Charge/CENRO Puerto Princesa City