

November 9, 2021

MEMORANDUM

FROM

FOR : Regional Executive Director DENR Region IV-MIMAROPA Thru: The Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Officer-Palawan

SUBJECT : ACK202110908-03 THE COMPLAINT OF SOLOMON RUMERO VIA ACTION KALAIKASAN AGAINST RHDD LUMBER TRADING OF

The Community Environment and Natural Resources Officer

HAROLD D. DESQUITADO

Respectfully forwarded is the memorandum on the above subject of the 8888 Focal Persons. As evidence of action taken, the forest products of eighty (80) pieces of mangium lumber and the vehicles were apprehended by our forest officers in Forest Product Monitoring Station IV as contained in the report submitted on October 11, 2021.

The adjudication proceeding on the incident shall be pushed through I consideration of the recommendation in the memorandum and all others therein including the allegation of seemingly a connivance in the follow up letter of the complainant received today from that Office. Today, we also received from the Office of the Regional Executive Director the copy of Certificate of Registration No. DENR MIMAROPA REGION 2021-006 (Renewal) of the RHDD Lumber Trading. Concerning this, please be informed that RHDD was caught of infraction of selling eighty (80) pieces of mangium lumber last September 18, 2021 despite our letter advice to temporarily stop its business while on the wait of the CRLD.

DENR CENRO TAYTAY, PALAWAN RELEASED IMM ALAN K. Copy furnished: NOV 12 2021 CN 3537

Copy furnished: <u>denr8888palawan@yahoo.com</u> <u>denr8888mimaropa@yahoo.com</u> <u>actioncenter@denr.gov.ph</u> <u>aksyonkalikasan@denr.gov.ph</u> <u>mimaroparegion@denr.gov.ph</u>



Republic of the Philippines Department of Environment and Natural Resources Region IV- MIMAROPA COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE By the National Highway, Poblacion, Taytay, Palawan, 5312 Mobile Contact Nos. 0926-505-9335, 0912-171-3889 Email: cenrotaytay@denr.gov.ph

November 9, 2021

MEMORANDUM

TO : The Chief, Enforcement and Monitoring Station The Chief, Regulation and Permitting Section

FROM : Community Environment and Natural Resources Officer

SUBJECT : ACK202110908-03 COMPLAINT WITH SERIES OF FOLLOW UP OF SOLOMON RUMERO AGAINST RHDD LUMBER TRADING OF HAROLD D. DESQUITADO IN VILLA LIBERTAD, EL NIDO, PALAWAN

Pertaining to the above subject, you are hereby instructed to investigate the allegation of Mr Rumero of seemingly a connivance of any in the Office and at the ENTMRPA Protected Area Management Officer to Mr Desquitado that enables him to sell lumber items despite absence of Certificate of Registration as such. The selling operation of RHDD is evident by the apprehension of FPMS IV on September 18, 2021 despite the letter advice of the Office dated August 20, 2021 to stop its operation. Submit report within seventy-two (72) hours upon receipt in consonance with the timeline of 8888 Citizens' Complaint Hotline.

The Enforcement Monitoring Section is also tasked to fast tract the adjudication proceedings of the apprehension of eighty (80) pieces of lumber.

Finally, you are hereby instructed to act on other recommendations in the report of the 8888 Focal persons on the matter.

Copy furnished: <u>denr8888palawan@yahoo.com</u> <u>denr8888mimaropa@yahoo.com</u> <u>actioncenter@denr.gov.ph</u> <u>aksyonkalikasan@denr.gov.ph</u>

> DENR CENRO TAYTAY, PALAWAN RELEASED BY: NOV 12 2021 for DATE: NOV 12 2021 for SC 98



November 9, 2021

MEMORANDUM

FOR

The Community Environment and Natural Resources Officer Attention : Chief, Regulation and Permitting Section Chief, Monitoring and Enforcement Section



FROM : Focal Persons of cenro8888taytay@gmail.com

SUBJECT : COMPLAINT AGAINST 'RHDD LUMBER SHOP STILL SELLING LUMBER WITHOUT LUMBER DEALER PERMIT

Received on my desk on November 4, 2021 is the above concern with Doc. Ref. 2021-5511 addressed to the Regional Executive Director with a copy received in this Office on November 2, 2021 bearing CN 5511. It is an 8888 originally referring to Ticket Reference Number ACK 20210908-03. It was sent through E-mail on November, 2021 alleging:

"... Nais ko lang po iparating sa inyo, na ang RHDD LUMBER owned by Mr. HAROLD DESQUITADO (located at Lio, Villa libertad, El Nido, Palawan) ay nanatiling bukas at nag bebenta ng kahoy kahit na walang Lumber Dealer Permit from DENR. MAKA ILANG BESES KO NA PO ITONG NA I REPORT SUBALIT PARANG WALANG AKSYON NA GINAGAWA. Hindi naman po tama na pinapayagan syang makapagbenta ng kahoy gayong kaming mga wala pang LUMBER DEALER ay pinasara at pinagbabawalang magbenta ng kahoy. Wala po ba talangang magagawa ang CENRO-TAYTAY PALAWAN na maipasara ito? Huwag na po sana umabot na makarating ito sa ibang government agency kung hindi parin mabigyan ng aksyon ang reklamo ko pong ito...." (Annex 1)

Urgent action

Acknowledgment letter dated November 4, 2021 was sent to the Complainant via Email address: <u>Solomonrumero@yahoo.com</u> with copies furnished to <u>denr@8888.gov.ph</u> <u>denr8888mimaropa@yahoo.com</u>, <u>denr8888palawan@yahoo.com</u> <u>mimaropareion@denr.gov.ph</u> and <u>aksyonkalikasan@denr.gov.ph</u> informing also that the folder of the case is under examination of the undersigned. (Annex 2)

Previous complaints

Above letter implies it is a follow through to previous complaint. Records disclose of similar complaint (Annex 3) received on September 20, 2021 (CN 4621) which reads:

"... FYI po, hindi pa rin po nagagawan ng CENRO TAYTAY na mapasara and RHDD lumber OWNED BY Mr. HAROLD DESQUITADO. Nag kakapag pa deliver parin ng truck truck na COCOLUMBER and RHDD LUMBER SHOP. Siguro naman po dahil walang LUMBER DEALER PERMIT AND RHDD LUMBER SHOP hindi sya pwede mag benta kahit na anong klaseng kahoy. Masyado po atang nag papabor and DENR CENRO TAYTAY SA RHDD LUMBER SHOP na ito at hindi nya kayang maipasara or na stop ng operation.

Complaint against RHHD LUMBER SHOP

Masyado pong unfair and ginagawa ng CENRO TAYTAY dahil kaming maliliit na lumber shop ay hinihigpitan nila kaya napilitan kaming mag sara at mag stop ng operation.

Sana po hindi na umabot na lumapit kami sa ibang agency para magawa nilang mapasara ang RHDD LUMBER SHOP..." (Annex 3)

Another E-mail of the same Complainant on 12:12 noon of September 7, 2021 is on records (Annex 4). It is an attachment to RED and PENRO memo dated September 17, 2021 and October 4, 2021, respectively. The Complainant wrote:

" ... Follow up ko lang po itong report ko. FYI PO, wala paring action ginagawa ang DENR CENRO TAYTAY, PALAWAN

ANG RHDD LUMBER SHOP owned by Harold Desquetado where in Lio, Bgy. Villa Libertad is still operating their lumber shop without lumber dealer permit.

Bakit po hindi parin pina pa stop and pag benta ng kahoy alam ko po at alam ng DENR CENRO TAYTAY na wala pa Lumber Dealer Permit and RHDD Lumber shop na ito.

Bong Badilla of By. Manlag, El Nido, Palawan.. walang cutting permit at walang lumber dealer pero nakakapag benta at nag cu-cut ng puno.

A and A LUMBER Trading located in Lio/Bgy. Villa Libertad, El Nido nakakapag display ng kahoy at nagbebenta kahit walang Lumber Dealer from DENR

RHDD Lumber Trading owned by Reynaldo and Harold Deskitado located in Lio/Villa Libertad, El Nido, Palawan NAKAKAPAG BENTA AT NAKAKAPAG PA DELIVER NG TRUCK TRUCK NG KAHOY KAHIT WALANG LUMBER DEALER FROM DENR.

DENR CENRO- TAYTAY told us na kapag walang Lumber dealer kailangan mag close, pero bakit pinapayagan ang mga to makapag pa deliver ng truck truck na kahoy at nakakapag bukas ng kanilang shop at nakakapagbenta ng kahoy kahit walang mga Lumber Dealer from DENR. Sana namn po ma-actionan nyo namn pag illegal. Unfair po kasi sa aming mag comply at naghihinitay ng approval ng aming application.

At marami po illegal loggers sa parte danat at manlag ..

Hindi po ito maaksyunan agad ng mga tauhan nyo kase kasabwat sila o nabibigyan.. marami ng mga illegalista dito sa el nido sana namn po kung magpapatupad kayo ng batas na bawal pag walang permit . sana bawal magpadeliver o magbenta para maging maaus at pantay lang ..."

Records

- A. Actions of the CENRO:
- 1. Letter request dated August 20, 2021 (CN 2639) to CENRO Roxas, Palawan to cease issuing transport permit to Lumber Traders in this jurisdiction, including RHDD of Harold Desquitado in Villa Libertad, El Nido, Palawan (Annex 5).

Page 2 of 5

Complaint against RHDD LUMBER SHOP

- Instruction through letters dated August 20, 2021 to various Lumber Traders including RHDD to stop operation until Certificate of Registration as Lumber Dealer (CRLD) is obtained (CN 2638 Annex 6).
- 3. Instructed the ENTMRPA Protected Area Superintendent (PASu) by memorandum dated September 10, 2021 to execute investigation on the complaint and to submit findings and recommendations (CN 2898 Annex 7).
- 4. Instructed all Forest Product Monitoring Station in the jurisdiction and the Quick Response Team by memorandum on September 10, 2021 to apprehend conveyances and forest products intended for unauthorized lumber yards (CN 2899 Annex 8).
- 5. Another instruction to ENTMRPA PASu dated September 17, 2021 to conduct investigation and submit report (CN 2897 Annex 9).
- 6. Another memo dated September 21, 2021 to all FPMS and the PASu instructing to execute investigation and submission of report (CN 2959 Annex 10).
- 7. Letter request for the Hon El Nido Mayor dated October 6, 2021 with the call of attention of the Business, Permit and Licensing Division to control the operation of the Lumber Trading businesses in the municipality (CN 3177 Annex 11)
- 8. Memorandum dated October 27, 2021 to Chief of Enforcement and Monitoring Section, particularly mentioning this concern of Solomon Rumero instructing to monitor the veracity of the complaint and to submit report (CN 3379 Annex 12).
- 9. The CENRO has four (4) memoranda all for the PENRO:
 - i) Memorandum dated August 23, 2021 (CN 2626 Annex 13)
 - ii) Memorandum dated September 17, 2021 (CN 3166 Annex 14)
 - iii) Memorandum dated September 21, 2021 (CN 2969 Annex 15), and
 - iv) Memorandum dated September 27, 2021 (CN 3057 Annex 16)
- B. Compliance/Updates on the actions of the CENRO
- a) On Item 1, the Monitoring Station Monthly Reports (MSMR) for August and September of various FPMS reveal of transport permits issued in CENRO Roxas, Palawan including few intended for RHDD. Most in the list were brought to various end-user consignees like resorts. There were also transport permits issued by this Office. Hence, there was no sincere compliance on the intention of the request.
- b) On item 2, report dated October 11, 2021 (CN 5136) of FPMS IV in Pasadeña, El Nido, Palawan discloses of an apprehension of eighty (80) pieces of mangium lumber, including the vehicles from RHDD. This established the basis of the complaint.
- c) On items 3 and 5, the PAMO submitted the following compliance:
 - Memorandum dated September 16, 2021 informing that RHDD had shifted to trading of coco lumber and held the trade of acasia mangium and Gmelina (CN 4575)
 - ii) Memorandum dated September 29, 2021 with the same information that RHDD had shifted to trading of Coco lumber (CN 4823)

Complaint against RHHD LUMBER SHOP

- d) For items 4, 6 and 8, some FPMS have just monitored the incidents of transport but the actions were not in full compliance of the instructions.
- e) There is no update about item 7 while for item 9, there is no acknowledgment receipt on record from the PENRO.

Evaluation

- The actions have already been lengthy but reached neither the various venues of DENR Action Center and hotline 8888 addressees nor to the Complainant even mere acknowledgment except Annex 2.
- Some actions are not even needed according to Quality Management System (QMS) including the compliances to the instructions. Periodic but surprise check and inventory of stocks at the Trading Businesses should have been more effective to ensure a zero violation as a condition for the eventual renewal of the CRLD.
- RHDD was caught still caught unauthorized selling of eighty (80) pieces of manglum lumber on September 18, 2021 despite the letter advice dated August 20, 2021 (Annex 6) and the report of APASu Jenuel P. Casel dated September 16, 2021 accordingly that its commodity had been shifted to coco lumber meantime the business registration is on the process.

Just in

- RHDD Lumber Trading has now legitimate under Certificate of Registration No. DENR MIMAROPA REGION-2021-006 (Renewal) and has a lumber supply contract up to two hundred thirty-nine and nineteen hundredths (239.19) cubic meters.
- Today, we received another follow-up Electronic mail of Solomon Rumero.

Recommendation

- Conduct the administrative adjudication of the forest products and vehicles recovered by Forest Product Monitoring Station IV despite the letter advice of the Office dated August 20, 2021 and the report of APASu Jenuel P. Casel dated September 16, 2021.
- Send update hereon to the DENR Action Center and furnishing copy to all Hotline 8888 venues, including the information about the issuance of Certificate of Registration (Draft attached).
- Inform Solomon Rumero of the development of his complaint, including acknowledgment of the receipt of his today's follow through letter, and the eventual renewal of the Certificate of Registration to RHDD Lumber Trading, furnishing copy to DENR Action Center and all Hotline 8888 venues (Draft attached).
- Investigate the Complainant's allegation of seemingly a connivance of any in the Office and in the PAMO as implied by the line "konektado po sya sa Taytay at sa denr el nido" in the letter and submit the report within seventy-two hours.
- Inform the Regional Executive Director of the recent infraction of RHDD as evidenced by the report of apprehension of FPMS IV for legal interpretation with regards the just renewed Certification of Registration as Lumber Dealer (CRLD).

Complaint against RHHD LUMBER SHOP

• Conduct periodic but surprise inventory of stock in all Lumber Trading businesses regardless registered or unregistered to ensure that all supplies are legitimate. Lumber Dealers who have doubtful stocks should be made to explain in observance of due process. Unsatisfactory explanation should result warnings and on repetitious cases should finally lead to cancellation of the CRLD. It will also help to strictly observe the regulation that transporters first drop at the nearest known DENR Stations at the point of destination before finally unloading the forest products at the consignee's yard. Existing rules say the receiving DENR Station is required to notify the originating DENR station of the arrival of the forest product ransport so allowed.

Manifestation

Mentioned above is the so-called Monitoring Station Monthly Report (MSMR) which reveals that it still had entries of incidents of transport which permits were intended for unregistered Lumber Trading businesses despite the cessation request of this Office to the Community Environment and Natural Resources Office of Roxas, Palawan. The same MSMR also reveals of transport permits which subject forest products were delivered to non-lumber traders like resorts or direct end users. Some in the entries were incidences of issuance even in this Office.

This issue was once brought out in the meeting at the PENRO to get a consensus of the CENR Offices in the province. Even the undersigned are into doubt on this, hence the guidance of the Legal Division is hereby solicited. Certainly, there is basis to reprimand a Lumber Dealer operating business without a certificate of registration. On the other hand, is there a legal basis to prohibit such unregistered Lumber Dealer to receive deliveries from legitimate sources? Should it also be mandatory that end users only buy from Lumber Dealers and not directly from tree farm owners? Should these be the cases by legal requirement, then the determination of legal consignees should therefore move further back as early as in the issuance of cutting permit!

Submitted:

ELVIEG BASE Administrative Officer I

MARIANO P. LILANG, JR. Development Management Officer IV



Paksa: ACK202110908-03

Ika-9 ng Nobyembre, 2021

G SOLOMON RUMERO

Sa pamamagitan ng solomonrumero@yahoo.com

Ginoo,

Pagbati po!

RELEASED

Natanggap po namin ngayon ang inyong muling elektronikong liham mula sa PENRO tungkol sa inyong nauna ng reklamo laban sa RHDD Lumbr Trading sa Villa Libertad, El Nido, Palawan. Nakapagsumite na po ng ulat ng pagsusuri ang dalawa naming Tutok Empleyado tungkol sa mga sangkot na isyu sa 8888. Ang tinurang ulat ay aming na rin isinumite ngayon sa PENRO at sa DENR Action Centers ng 8888 pangrehiyon hanggang pang nasyonal na antas.

Batay sa aming talaan, may nahuli po kami noong ika-18 ng Setyembre, 2021 na mga kahoy, kasama ang sasakyan mula sa RHDD Lumber Trading at ang mga ito ay nakatambak ngayon sa aming Forest Product Monitoring Stations sa Pasadeña, El Nido, Palawan. Ang mga ito ay isasailalim sa pagdinig. Ipasisiyasat din namin ang inyong alegasyon na si G. Desquitado ay tila may pakikpagsabwatan sa sino man sa aming hanay.

Ngayong araw ay natanggap din namin mula sa Tanggapan ng Pangrehiyong Patnugot Tagapagpaganap ng MIMAROPA nito ahensya (Regional Executive Director) and sipi ng Certificate of Registration ng RHDD Lumber Trading ni Ginoong Desquitado. Titiyakin po namin na ang kanyang operasyon ay nasa aming pagbabantay.

Nabigyan nawa po namin kayo ng linaw tungkol dito. Magsusulat po kami muli kung kinakailangan.

Maraming salamat po sa inyong kontirbusyon may kaugnayan sa aming tungkulin.

Lubos na sumasainyo,

ALAN

Community Environment and Natural Resources Officer

Copy furnished: <u>denr@8888.gov.ph</u> denr8888mimaropa@yahoo.com denr8888palawan@yahoo.com <u>mimaroparegion@denr.gov.ph</u> aksyonkalikasan@denr.gov.ph