May 20, 2022

# **MEMORANDUM**

FOR

The SECRETARY

THRU

The Regional Executive Director

**DENR-MIMAROPA** Region

**FROM** 

:

.

.

:

The OIC - PENR Officer

**SUBJECT** 

REQUEST FOR REPRESENTATION BY THE SECRETARY THRU THE REGIONAL EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE AUDIT OBSERVATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE NATIONAL GREENING PROGRAM (NGP) AND ENHANCED NGP FOR C.Y. 2011 TO 2016 AND 2017 TO

JUNE 30, 2021.

This pertains to the Audit Recommendation pursuant to the Management Letter sent by the Commission on Audit (COA) as regards the Compliance Audit on the NGP and Enhanced NGP Implemented from CY 2011 to 2016 and 2017 to June 30, 2021. This Office has initially submitted its response concerning this matter however, we respectfully request for representation with regard to the following actions which require attention and further action of higher authority, to wit:

- 1. Coordination with the agencies such as the Department of Agriculture (DA) IV-B, Department of Agrarian Reform (DAR), Commission of Higher Education (CHED), and Department of Education (DepEd) in the province under the Convergence Initiative to strengthen the role of such agencies concerned specifically the production of quality seedlings annually for the NGP pursuant to Section 7.2.2 of the DENR Memorandum Circular No. 2011-01;
- 2. Clarification on the formulation of the specific guidelines for the turnover of the projects to the DENR by project partners after the expiration of the contract period as required under Section 6 of the DENR Memorandum Circular No. 2013-06;

3. Verifying the issuance of specific guidelines covering NGP & ENGP projects implemented through comprehensive site development with area below 100 hectares which is not covered under DENR Memorandum Circular No. 2013-06 which applies only to NGP and Enhanced NGP tree plantations with area of 100 hectares and above.

Attached herewith is a copy of the Management Letter from the Auditor and the Agency Action Plan and Status Implementation (AAPSI) which was submitted by this Office to the COA Auditor.

For your information, consideration and further instruction.

IMELDA M. DIAZ

cc:

Director, Forest Management Bureau Ms. Connie G. Benedictos, Regional Supervising Auditor Ms. Joy A. Marasigan, State Auditor III

# 1 1 No. 14

## DENR- PENRO MARINDUQUE

### AGENCY ACTION PLAN and STATUS of IMPLEMENTATION

#### **Audit Observation and Recommendations**

#### For the Calendar Year 2022

As of March 25, 2022

	T	T.		Agency Action Plan	<del> </del>	<del></del> 1		T	1
Ref	Audit Observation	Audit Recommendation	4.4. 70		Target Imple	nentation Date	Status of Implementation	Reason for Partial/Delay/Non-	Action Taken/Action to be Taken
L			Action Plan	Action Plan Person/Dept. Responsible From To	Implementation, if applicable				
		a. The Budget Officer, Accountant, Chief, Technical Services Division, Chief, Conservation and Development Section and NGP Coordinator to submit satisfactory explanation for the charging of expenditures for MOOE and other PPE against the CO-Reforestation Projects;		Budget Officer/Accountant/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					Already stopped the charging of expenditures for project monitoring and supervision against Capital Outlay and shall request additional MOOE fund from the Regional Office or Central Office if needed.
	Of the funds earmarked for the implementation of the	b. The Chief, Technical Services Division, Chief, Conservation and Development Section and NGP Coordinator to ensure that charges as requesting office of NGP/ENGP are within the mandate of NGP/ENGP;	To monitor regularly the charging of funds in the e-NGP.	Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going Con-going		To secure copy of e-NGP disbursements from the finance section.
Cisbursement of Funds	Of the funds earmarked for the implementation of the NGP and Enhanced NGP from CY 2011 to 2016 and CY 2017 to 2021 of F62, 472,085.00 and F25,059,521.74, F53,740,387.64 and F2,322,917.08, respectively, were exclusively used for the purpose intended as per approved Annual Work and Financial Plan (WFP) and the yearly budget for NGP/ENGP per GAA and were duly accountee for. However, the amount of F503,936.52 and F13,000.00 were used not in line with the NGP and Enhanced NGP mandate. Thus, the agency is not fully compliant with the pertinent General Provision of the General Appropriations Act (GAA) from FY 2011 to 2021.	appropriations for program, projects and activities of the Forest and Development, Rehabilitation and Protection in relation to the implementation of the NGP are within the approved Annual WFP, and the corresponding reports on the receipts and obligations		Budget Officer					
		d. The Accountant to review the propriety of charges to be made and allow only those which are exclusively in line with the purpose of and within the approved WFP of NGP/e-NGP.		PENRO Accountant					
Procurement and/or Production & Distribution of Seedlings #60		representation with the DENR Secretary through the Regional Executive Director for the coordination with the agencies under the Convergence Initiative to strengthen the roles of the agencies concerned specifically the production of quality seedlings	To write a memo to DENR Secretary through the RED regarding coordination with the agencies under the Convergence Initiative to strengthen the role s of the agencies concerned as stated in Section 7.2.2 of DENR MC No. 2011- 01.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Apr-22	May-22	On-going		The memo to be prepared shall be submitted to DENR Secretary.

	١	•	
--	---	---	--

			Agency Action Plan					Reason for Partial/Delay/Non-	
Ref	Audit Observation	Audit Recommendation	Action Plan	Person/Dept, Responsible		nentation Date	Status of Implementation	Implementation, if applicable	Action Taken/Action to be Taken
				7	From	To			
Sustainable Management & continued maintenance and protection of established tree plantations in CY 2011 to 2012 #66	Of the 63 NGP tree plantations established from Calendar Years (CYs) 2011-2012 costing  P8,067,433.00, only six plantations or 9.52% with total cost of P936,891.00 are under the maintenance and protection of the People's Organizations (POs)  Community Groups (CGs), while 54 projects or 85.71% costing P7,130,542.00 were not adopted under the maintenance and protection by the POs/CGs, thus PENRO Marindayue is not totally compliant with Sections 6 and 7.4.1 of DENR MC No. 2011-01 dated March 8, 2011.	The OIC- PENR Officer agreed to make representation with the Regional Executive Director for the allocation of funds for the NGP sites not adopted or under the continuous protection and maintenance of the People's Organizations/Community Groups, to ensure that sustainability and protection will be maintained.	1. To conduct regular monthly site visit, tree planting, among other activities of forest protection to continually monitor the status of NGP/e-NGP areas and secure support of the POs/individual in the areas.  2. NGP sites are included in the patrol plan of LAWIN.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		Ensure that regular monthly site visit, tree planting and inclusion of NGP sites in the patrol plan of LAWIN are documented and reported to determine the status of NGP/e-NGP.
period	All of the evaluated 430 NGP and ENGP contracts amounting to P55,874,292.00 were not submitted to COA within five days from date of perfection of the contracts. Thus, PENRO Marinduque was not fully compliant with COA Circular No. 2009-01 dated February 12, 2009 as regards the submission of contract within five days from date of executuion.	The OIC-PENR Officer to instruct the In-Charge, Office of the Management Services Division MSD and the Supply Officer I/Head BAC Secretariat to secure a copy of the perfected contracts from endusers and ensure that the Audit Team is provided with certified reproduced copies within the period prescribed in COA Circular No. 2009-001 dated February 12, 2009, to avoid delay in the auditorial review and prevent suspension or disallowance in audit, in case of deficiencies, if any.	To furnish the Office of the Auditor all perfected contracts together with complete supporting documents within five days from the date of issuance.	-Charge Office of the MSD/ Supply Officer VHead BAC Secretariat	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		Ensure that copy of perfected NGP contracts were provided to PBAC Secretariat for submission to the Office of the Auditor.
	All the 142 NGP and e-NGP projects amounting to \$\mathbb{P}47,224,452.00 from CY 2011 to June 2021 were	That the OIC-PENR Officer to stop establishing NGP plantations in tenured forest lands unless the tenurial contract is first terminated/revoked/cancelled; and	To double check the area subjected to e- NGP plantation establishment to ensure that it will be established in lands of untenured public domain.	OIC- PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/ Chief, CDS/ NGP Coordinator	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		GIS- maps generated during surveying and mapping of NGP areas shall be overlaid to One Control Map'of the PENRO Marinduque to ensure that it is not located in tenured areas.
Establishment of tree plantations within the lands of public domain from CY 2011 to 0, 2021. #85	established in lands of public domain as provided for in Section 2 of EO No. 26 dated February 24, 2011 and DENR MC No. 2011-01 dated March 8, 2011. However, out of the 65 NGP Projects for CT 2013- 2016, nine NGP projects/tree plantations costing P2,340,044.44 were established in areas covered with tenurial instruments or agreements even if said agreements were not yet cancelled/expired, thus PENRO Marinduque is not fully compliant with Section 2 of DER MC No. 2013-06 dated April 16, 2013.	People's Organization for the continuous maintenance and protection of NGP tree plantations pursuant to Section 3.1.2 of EO No. 26 and Section 6 of DENR MC No. 2011-01 considering that NGP	To ensure that no cutting permit will be granted in the protection forest and utilization of products by tenured holder will be limited in the production forest only.	RPS/MES	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		contracts were provided to PBAC Secretariat for submission to the Office of the Auditor.  GIS- maps generated during surveying an mapping of NGP areas shall be overlaid to One Control Map* of the PENRO Marinduque to ensure that it is not locate in tenured areas.  Monitor the activities of the tenured holders in the area.  The memo to be prepared shall be
Reforestation projects were turned over by	contracts were not turned over to the DENR after the	a OIC- PENR Officer to make representation with the DENR Secretary through the Regional Executive Director for the formulation of specific guidelines for the turn-over of the projects to the DENR;	To write a memo to DENR Secretary through the RED regarding clarification on the formulation of specific guidelines for the turn-over of the projects to the DENR.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					The memo to be prepared shall be submitted to DENR Secretary.
the NGP project Partners upon the expiration of the contract period #99	while 56 projects were not turned over due to lack of clear specific guidelines for project turnover. Moreover, the report on joint inspection and validation conducted by PENRO, CENROs and DENR Regional Office No. IV-B disclosed that only 15 projects below 100 hectares were validated, and all failed to meet the 85% survival equirement under Section 5.2 of said MC. Thus, PENRO Marinduque was not compliant with the said provisions	NGP Coordinator to ensure proper planning and	To conduct surveying, mapping and planning at the level of PENRO Marinduque together with the concern community to assess the area better.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		Conduct of perimeter surveying and mapping of the area and consultation/ice/meetings during planning with the community.

			Agency Action Plan						
Ref	Audit Observation	Audit Recommendation	Action Plan Person/Dept. Responsible		Target Implementation Date		Status of Implementation	Reason for Partial/Delay/Non- Implementation, if applicable	Action Taken/Action to be Taken
			Action Fian	rerson/Dept. Responsible	From	To		Implementation, it applicable	
		c. Institute remedy of actions to enforce the conduct of validation for completed NGP projects to assess the impact of the program and as basis for the release of the final payment; and	To request assistance from the Regional Office in the conduct of final validation for completed NGP projects not yet turned-over.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/PENRO NGP Staff/RO NGP Validation Team	Арт-22	Dec. 2028			To submit the request of validation to the Regional Office through the Regional NGP Coordinator.
		d. Ensure compliance with the provisions of DENR MC No. 2013-06 to achieve the main objective of the National Greening Program	To review the DENR MC No. 2013-06.	Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/PENRO NGP Staff	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going Congression		File copy of DENR MC No. 2013-06 and all other guidelines, technical bulletins, memorandum circulars, ets relative to the implementation of the enhanced NGP.
Full payments of NGP/e- NGP projects were only made if the projects' turned-over have met the 5% SR #112		The OIC-PENR Officer, NGP Coordinator and Accountant submit explanation why the 39 NGP projects amounting to \$3,094,913.00 were fully paid despite the absence of the required 85% survival rate in the Inspection Reports of Accomplishment of the Technical Inspection Committee. Moreover, instruct the Accountant to demand refund from the concerned contractors for the overpayment of \$73,500.00 net of tax, in the progress billing.		OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Accountant/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					
The Registry of Reforestation/ Agroforestry Projects has been maintained for all NGP/ Enhanced #120	The Registry of Reforestation/Agroforestry Projects has been maintained by the Accounting Unit for all NGP/Enhanced NGP Projects, however, it was not for each NGP site contrary to Section 10 of DENR MC No. 2011-01 dated March 8, 2011 which further resulted in the non-monitoring of each NGP site and difficulty in ascertaining project cost. Moreover, the NGP Coordinator provided list of reforestation projects per site but the project cost was not included in the said llist.	We recommended that the OIC —PENR Officer require the Accountant in coordination with the NGP Coordinator to prepare and maintain the Registry of Reforestation/Agroforestry Projects for each NGP/ENGP site to serve as a monitoring tool for all NGP and eNGP projects.	To prepare and maintain the Registry of Reforestation/Agroforestry Projects for each NGP/e-NGP to serve as monitoring tools for the said projects.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M Diaz/Accountant/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Nov-21	Dec. 2028	On-going		To make available the monitoring tools- Registry of Reforestation/Agroforestry Projects in PENRO Marinduque.
and Continued Maintenance and Protection of NGP Projects turned over to the DENR from CY 2013	2017 to 2018 amounting to P7,424,369,00 were turned over. All of the 73 NGP and ENGP projects were not under the Sustainable	The OIC - PENR Officer agreed to make representation with the Regional Executive Director for the allocation of funds for the NGP sites not adopted nor under the continuous maintenance and protection by People's Organizations to ensure that sustainability and protection will be maintained.	To write a memo to RED for allocation of funds for the NGP sites not adopted nor under the continuous maintenance and protection by People's Organization to ensure that sustainability will be maintained.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					The memo to be prepared shall be submitted to Regional Office.

-	41	•	
e'			

	I	T	1	Agency Action Plan		T	I		
Ref	Audit Observation	Audit Recommendation	Action Plan	Person/Dept. Responsible	Target Imple	mentation Date	Status of Implementation	Reason for Partial/Delay/Non- Implementation, if applicable	Action Taken/Action to be Taken
			Action I lan	Terson Dept. Responsible	From	To		париненации, и аррисави	
DENR has monitoring mechanisms to ensure	PENRO Marinduque has monitoring mechanisms to ensure completion of the projects, however, 54 NGP projects with total cost of ₱10,336,076.00 were not completed within the three-year period due to absence/cancellation of contract during the second year	That the OIC- PENR Officer instruct the Chief, Technical Services Division, Chief, Conservation and Development Section and NGP Coordinator to: a. submit satisfactory explanation and status report on the deficiencies noted above and strengthen the monitoring control in order to address immediately the identified problems for the timely completion of the NGP projects;	To write a memo to Chief, TSD, Chief, CDS and NGP Coordinator to explain and submit report on the said issue.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					The memo to be prepared shall be given to Chief, TSD, Chief CDS and NGP Coordinator.
completion of the projects within the contract eriod #136	and third year maintenance and protection. Moreover, 238 NGP and ENGP contracts amounting to P29,679,940.50 were not completed within the contract time thus, not fully compliant with Sections 7.4 & 9 of DENR MC No. 2011-01 and Section 5 of DENR MC No. 2013-06.	b. conduct regular monitoring and evaluation of all NGP/ENGP projects to ensure compliance of the development partners to the terms and conditions of the contract; and	To assign site coordinator/s to ensure that partner/stakeholders complied to the terms and conditions of the contract.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/PENRO NGP Staff	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going	the compliance of the partner/s	Site Coordinators to monitor and evaluate the compliance of the partner/stakeholders to the terms and conditions stipulated in the contract.
		c. institute remedial actions to enforce the conduct of validation for completed NGP projects in order for the retention money to be released or forfeited in favor of the government.	To request assistance from the Regional Office in the conduct of final validation for completed NGP projects not yet turned-over.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/PENRO NGP Staff/RO NGP Validation Team	Арт-22	Dec. 2028		No new Regional NGP Coordinator yet assigned (The former Regional NGP Coordinator was designated as OIC- ARD for Management Services in DENR-NCR on March 23, 2022)	To submit the request of validation to the Regional Office through the Regional NGP Coordinator.
Request for relief from accountability	As of June 30, 2021, reforestation projects lost due to typhoon, fire or force majeure with total assessed value of P15,147,624.33 consisting of 187 projects were not requested for relief from property accountability since responsibility and liability over turned over reforestation projects were not clearly defined. Thus, PENRO Marindaque was not compliant with Section 73(1) of PD No. 1445, COA Memorandum No. 92-751 dated February 24, 1992 and COA resolution No. 2018-020 dated February 1, 2018.	a. That the OIC-PENR Officer to exercise the diligence of a good father of a family in safeguarding government funds or property, being primarily responsible thereon; and	To always safeguard government funds or property.	OIC- PENRO Imelda M. Diaz	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	on-going		To supervise and regularly monitor the government funds and property in PENRO Marinduque.
for loss of reforestation projects due to fire or other casualty or majeure		b. direct the accountable officer to (i) file notice of loss to the Office of the Auditor concerned; (ii) file request for relief from property accountability supported with pertinent documents; and (iii) submit satisfactory explanation or the reason/s for the delay in the filing of such notice and request in compliance with COA Memorandum No. 92-751 dated February 24, 1992.		Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Арт-22	Dec. 2022	On-going		To prepare the pertinent documents for relief from property accounatability for submission to the Office of the Auditor.
Tree Replacement	One thousand three hundred seventy eight of the trees affected by DPWH infrastructure projects were replaced by only 18,777 by DPWH resulting in loss of 119,023 trees which is the equivalent number of trees that should have been replaced for the total number of cut trees within or along the RROW of DPWH administered infrastructure projects pursuant to Item III of Joint Memorandum Circular (JMC) o. 1 dated July 3, 2014.	a. That the OIC- PENRO Officer to make representation with the DENR Regional Executive Director to address the issue of non- implementation of JMC No. 1-2014; and	To write a memo to RED to address the issue of non-implementation of JMC No. 1-2014	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator					The memo to be prepared shall be submitted to Regional Office.
#161		b. direct the Chief, TSD to demand from DPWH or its Contractor concern the replacement of the cut trees in compliance to the Tree Replacement Program.	To continously monitor the compliance of the DPWH contractors relative to tree cutting replacement.	Chief, TSD/MES/RPS	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		To follow-up/conduct meetings with the DPWH contractors.
DENR have complied with the required Reports on the Status of Accomplishment of the NGP/eNGP from 2011- 2018 #170	photos of the sites, and 191 and five projects with accomplishment reports were posted in the DENR-FMB website for a period of three years. Moreover the impact of the program to the communities was not posted in the laid website. In addition, proof of submission of the said	That the OIC – PENR Officer (a) instruct the PENRO NGP Coordinator to ensure that all projects, geo-tagged photos of the sites, shapefiles and accomplishment reports as well as the impact of the program to the communities are all posted in the DENR-FMB website and coordinate regularly with the DENR Regional Office No. IV-B for the complete posting of the reports; and	To coordinate with the Regional Office throught the Regional NGP on the complete posting of NGP reports to DENR website.	OIC- PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028	On-going		To regularly monitor posting of NGP reports in the DENR website.

Ref			L	Agency Action Plan						
	Ref	Audit Observation	Audit Recommendation	Action Plan	Person/Dept. Responsible	Target Imple	nentation Date	Status of Implementation	Reason for Partial/Delay/Non- Implementation, if applicable	Action Taken/Action to be Taken
<u> </u>					z or some zope, responsible	From	To		ampanian a apperant	
			(b) provide the Audit Team with copies of the submitted reports to DENR Regional Office No. IV-B for verification of the completeness of the projects posted in the said website.	To provide the copies of the transmitted reports to Audit Team.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/NGP Coordinator	Apr-22	May-22			To compile all the reports submitted to Regional Office regarding geo-tagged photos of the sites, shapefiles and accomplishment reports.
	her vations 80	the strategies under Section 3 of EO No. 26 dated February 24, 2011 and the modality under Sections 5 and 6 of DENR MC No. 2011-01dated March 8, 2011. Moreover, the updated NGP guidelines per DENR MC No. 2013-06 dated April 16, 2013 applies only to NGP and Enhanced NGP tree plantations with area of 100	a. That the OIC-PENR Officer to make representation with the DENR Secretary through the Regional Executive Director for the issuance of specific implementing guidelines covering NGP and	To write a memo to DENR Secreatry through the RED in verifying the issuance of specific implementing guidelines covering NGP and Enhanced NGP projects implemented through comprehensive site development with area below 100 hectares.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief, TSD/Chief, CDS/PENRO NGP Staff	Apr-22	May-22			The memo to be prepared shall be submitted to DENR Secretary.
			only in untenured, open access areas, and	To ensure that areas to be developed are to be established only in untenured, open access areas, and undeveloped portion of areas.	OIC-PENRO Imelda M. Diaz/Chief. TSD/Chief. CDS/PENRO NGP Staff	Jan. 2022	Dec. 2028			Conduct of perimeter surveying and mapping of the area and consultation/iet/meetings during planning with the community.

Agency sign-off:

IMELDA M. DIAZ OIC-PENR Officer

Date