



CREATION OF THE GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS OF BACUIT – EL NIDO BAY (BENB) WATER QUALITY MANAGEMENT AREA

Minutes of Meeting

Date: 23 August 2022

Time Started: 1400H

Venue: Virtual Meeting via Microsoft Teams

Attendees:

1. RD Bevienn G. Malateo	Department of Tourism (DOT) / Regional Director
2. Faye Angeli A. Reyes	Department of Tourism (DOT)
3. Michael Casto II Ras	Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG)
4. Melissa Magbanua	Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG)
5. Atty. Shirley Garcia	Department of Public Works and Highways (DPWH)
6. Nilette F. Fidel	Department of Health (DOH)
7. Pamela L. De Torres	National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA)
8. Christian Jay Cojamco	Palawan Provincial Information Office (Palawan PIO)
9. Daryl Licero	Palawan Council for Sustainable Development (PCSDS)
10. Rodel Lampines	Palawan Council for Sustainable Development (PCSDS)
11. Theo Lagrada	LGU – El Nido
12. Allan Valle	DENR – CENRO El Nido
13. Engr. Eduardo Orguisita	Municipal Economic Enterprise and Development (MEEDO)
14. Brian Abin	Municipal Economic Enterprise and Development (MEEDO)
15. Rogelio Manlavi	Fisheries and Aquatic Resources Management Council (FARMC)
16. Charity Apale	Zoological Society of London (ZSL)
17. Mildred Suza	ENTMRPA PAMB / PASu
18. Steven John B. Andao	ENTMRPA PAMB
19. RD Joe Amil M. Salino	EMB MIMAROPA / Regional Director
20. Engr. Pablito Estorque Jr.	EMB MIMAROPA / OIC, EMED
21. Edna S. Velasco	EMB MIMAROPA / PEMU Palawan
22. Maevelyn Kathryn D. Tupasi	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
23. Jane T. Dumenden	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
24. Adz Hazen M. Dimapilis	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
25. Nicaith Trisha Enrile	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
26. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
27. Rio Reyes	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat
28. Sharmaine G. Maniego	EMB MIMAROPA / BENB WQMA Secretariat

BENB WQMA Members	:	22 members
Number of Members Present	:	14 members
Number of Members Absent	:	08 members

Representatives from the following agency/office members were unable to attend the meeting:

1. Department of Trade and Industry (DTI)
2. Department of Science and Technology (DOST)
3. Department of Human Settlements and Urban Development (DHSUD)



4. National Water Resources Board (NWRB)
5. Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR)
6. El Nido Chamber of Commerce and Industry (ENCCI)
7. Association of Barangay Captains (ABC)
8. Academe / DepED Division of Palawan

PROCEEDINGS:

A. Call To Order

The governing board meeting officially started about 1400H. The meeting started with an opening prayer led by Ms. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora, Technical Staff of EMB MIMAROPA. Ms. Jane T. Dumenden, Senior Environmental Management Specialist acknowledged the presence of the attendees of the meeting.

The quorum was achieved in the middle of the meeting since the creation of the governing board were formally designated, with a total of fourteen (14) governing board members present.

B. Presentation of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the previous meeting were presented by the BENB Secretariat. However, due to no official designation of the governing board members of BENB WQMA. The approval of the minutes was put on hold since the governing board members has not yet been formally established.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat further explained the findings on the on-site field work conducted with the governing board members in the established stations. The concerns raised from the previous meeting were elaborated by the BENB WQMA Secretariat.

C. Matters arising from the Minutes

No inquiries or remarks raised from the presented minutes and the meeting proceeded on discussing the provisional agenda.

D. Presentation of the Provisional Agenda

1. Presentation of the minutes of the first orientation meeting last 14-15 June 2022
2. Presentation of the submitted names as Permanent and Alternate Representatives of each Member Agency
3. Formal Creation of Board through Board Resolution
4. Presentation of the Draft Work and Financial Plan for 2024 and Approval through a Board Resolution
5. Way Forward: Draft Governing Rules and Draft Action Plan
6. Other Matters: Water Quality Status

The BENB WQMA Secretariat proceeded on the presentation of the above stated agenda.

E. Presentation on the Members of the Governing Board of BENB WQMA

The BENB WQMA Secretariat presented first the Section 4 of DENR Administrative Order No. 2021-44 (DAO 2021-44): the Creation of the BENB WQMA Governing Board, which the Regional Director of EMB MIMAROPA shall chairs the governing board, with the representatives from the different sectors and agencies. The BENB WQMA Secretariat added that there was a total of three (3) identified NGOs namely: El Nido Foundation Inc., Zoological Society of London, and Malampaya Foundation Inc., which focused on the environmental protection, however, the Malampaya Foundation Inc. were unable to proceed to its membership as a governing board member due to lack of personnel.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat added the other members that could participate on the Governing Board Meeting by invitation, however, they will be unable to approve and veto in the meeting. The BENB



WQMA Secretariat proceeded in the presentation of the Permanent Representative and Alternative Representative/s.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat also discussed the Section 5: Functions of the Governing Board, Section 8: Technical Working Group and Technical Secretariat (introduced the interim Technical Secretariat of BENB WQMA), and Section 9: Multi Sectoral Group of DAO 2021-44. The BENB WQMA Secretariat also presented the Proposed Composition of the Multi Sectoral Committee and Election of Officers, which the Composition of Executive Committee were also illustrated.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat also introduced the Proposed Composition of the Governing Board Committees and illustrated the Proposed Organizational Structure of BENB WQMA.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat finished the presentation on asking the members for their comments.

CONCERNS/INQUIRIES	RESPONSE
Engr. Pablito Estorque Jr., OIC of Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Division (EMED) of EMB MIMAROPA inquired the total number of the board members.	Ms. Tupasi responded that there was a total of 22 members.
Engr. Estorque Jr., further asked if its amenable for the board to set the quorum as 50% + 1 to the governing board members (12 members)	RD Beviene G. Malateo from DOT agreed in the comment section to follow the 50% + 1 for purposes of determining the quorum. RD Joe Amil M. Salino from EMB MIMAROPA also agreed to the given proposition.
Mr. Michael Casto II Ras, from the DILG clarified that the meeting was not in quorum as there were on 11 members present.	Ms. Tupasi replied that the governing board members were still not officially created, hence, the meeting still proceeded.
Engr. Estorque Jr. inquired that there are some members that were able to participate in the middle of the meeting.	Ms. Dumenden, acknowledge presence of these attendees.
Mr. Ras clarified that some overlapping of members in the committee presented and added that the governing board members also functions as officers. He also concludes that there are multi representation for the members, which he finds it an issue since the members has multiple positions.	Ms. Tupasi clarified that the Composition of the Board Committees are only proposed, and it can be revised accordingly. Engr. Estorque Jr., further discussed the Organizational Structure of the BENB WQMA and suggested to revise the Proposed Composition of Board Committees. Ms. Tupasi proceeded in revising the Proposed Composition of Board Committees accordingly to the members suggestions.
RD Salino requested for acknowledgement of the new attendees.	Ms. Dumenden proceeded in acknowledging the presence of the new attendees.
RD Salino also inquired the duly representatives of the committee.	Ms. Tupasi responded that there were only three (3) members of the board to provide their representatives from the circulated letter.



RD Salino requested from the present attendees, to provide their Permanent Representative and Alternate Representative.	Ms. Tupasi proceeded to implore from the members their permanent and alternate representatives.
Engr. Estorque Jr. confirmed that there were 13 members on board.	

F. Presentation the BENB WQMA Resolution No. 2022-01: Creation of the Interim Technical Secretariat and Sector Representatives of BENB WQMA Governing Board

The BENB WQMA Board Resolution No. 2022-01 was presented by the BENB WQMA Secretariat. Based on the counted attendees, there were a total of fourteen (14) members on board in the meeting.

The Board Resolution No. 2022-01 was anonymously approved and seconded by the members of the board.

G. Presentation of the Draft Work and Financial Plan for 2024 and Approval through a Board Resolution

The BENB WQMA Secretariat presented the BENB WQMA Work and Financial Plan for 2024. Accordingly, the Secretariat disclosed that the BENB WQMA has already acquired accrued funds with an estimate total of Php 254,899.98. The said fund was accumulated from the collected wastewater discharge fees from the business establishments and will be utilized in purchasing the portable water checker, and dye tracers. The BENB WQMA Secretariat further stated that the elected officers especially the Treasurer, together with the Finance Committee will be handling the Work and Financial Plan. The approval of the Work and Financial Plan for 2024 will moved once there are elected officers and the governing rules have fully established.

H. Way Forward: Draft Governing Rules and Draft Action Plan

The Governing Rules and Action Plan have already been drafted according to BENB WQMA Secretariat, however due to lack of time, the drafted documents will be sent out through email for further review of the Governing Board Members. The approval for the Governing Rules and Action Plan will be moved in a face-to-face meeting.

I. Presentation of Water Quality Status

The BENB WQMA Secretariat illustrated the updated maps of the established monitoring stations within the coverage of the BENB WQMA.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat also presented the Water Quality Status of the Bacuit Bay including the Fecal Coliform which some monitoring stations failed to comply on the Water Quality Guidelines (WQG). The physio-chemical properties such as Dissolved Oxygen (DO) was also presented. The high concentration of DO is due to the waves and occurrence of rains and as temperature rises, the lower the DO levels are. There was no concern regarding the levels of pH and phosphates. In terms of Total Suspended Solids, it has an increasing level of concentration especially in the station of Masagana, as there were two (2) outfalls discharging in the station.

The BENB WQMA Secretariat also presented the laboratory results for Bacuit Bay outfalls with the following parameters: Fecal Coliform, Dissolved Oxygen, pH, and Total Suspended Solids. The Water Quality for the Tourist Destinations for the First Semester was also illustrated.

The CY 2022 Water Quality of El Nido Bay was also presented, and in terms of Fecal Coliform, the station of Caalan Beach and Calitang Beach has the highest concentration especially since the Calitang Beach is near the Fisher's Village where the area served as a docking place for fishing boats. It was also stated that the Lio Port is connected on the Lio River, which is one of the tributaries in the area. It was also observed



that there is also an increase on the Fecal Coliform concentration in the Nacpan Beach due to the rise of the establishments near the beach.

The Bacuit Bay Trend Data (Offshore, Coastal, Outfalls, and Tourist Destinations) from year 2017 to 2021 was also illustrated with addition of the El Nido Bay Trend Data from year 2020 to 2021.


J. Agreements/Approved/Proposals Made during the Meeting

Governing Board	<p>The following were approved during the meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- BENB WQMA Board Resolution No. 2022-01: <i>Creation of the Interim Technical Secretariat and Sector Representatives of BENB WQMA Governing Board</i> <p>(The Board Resolution No. 2022-01 was anonymously approved and seconded by the members of the board.)</p>
	<p>Circulation of the following documents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Signed BENB WQMA Board Resolution No. 2022-01- Work and Financial Plan for CY 2024- Drafted Governing Rules and Action Plan- Updated Water Quality Monitoring Report
	<p>The approval for the Governing Rules and Action Plan will be moved in a face-to-face meeting.</p>
	<p>The approval of the Work and Financial Plan for 2024 will moved once there are elected officers and the governing rules have fully established.</p>

K. Closing Remarks

The closing remarks was led by RD Salino. The tentative agreed date for the next BENB WQMA Governing Board Meeting was October 12, 2022, and the meeting adjourned at 1640H.

Prepared by:


Ma. Kimberly B. Evora
EMED Technical Staff