

**DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES**  
**Summary of Audit Observations and Recommendations**  
**For Calendar Year 2022**  
**(For Discussion Purposes Only)**

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder																				
Financial Audit																								
CAAR CY 2022 par. 1	<p><b>Accounting Errors/Omissions</b></p> <p>Various accounting errors/omissions with an aggregate amount of ₱1,630.755 million affected the fair presentation of the Financial Statements (FS).</p> <table><tr><th>Error/Omission</th><th>Amount (in million PhP)</th></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded/delayed recording of bank accounts/ deposits/check disbursements/ refunds/ fund transfers/ reconciling items and other transactions</td><td>0.279</td></tr><tr><td>Non-cancellation of stale checks/unreleased checks not restored to Cash account; signed blank checks; dishonored checks; non-disposal of unused obsolete checks</td><td>0.400</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous recording of receivables</td><td>24.813</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded/unbooked receivables</td><td>38.134</td></tr><tr><td>Improper recognition of Impairment Loss for Receivables-Disallowances/ Charges and Other Receivables</td><td>0.323</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded deliveries from PS-DBM</td><td>123.755</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded issuances/disposal/loss/ transfer of inventory/semi-expendable property or Report of Materials and Supplies Issued (RSMI)</td><td>5.002</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous recording of Inventory transactions/misclassification of accounts/abnormal or negative balances</td><td>7.023</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded purchases of PPEs</td><td>4.613</td></tr></table>	Error/Omission	Amount (in million PhP)	Unrecorded/delayed recording of bank accounts/ deposits/check disbursements/ refunds/ fund transfers/ reconciling items and other transactions	0.279	Non-cancellation of stale checks/unreleased checks not restored to Cash account; signed blank checks; dishonored checks; non-disposal of unused obsolete checks	0.400	Erroneous recording of receivables	24.813	Unrecorded/unbooked receivables	38.134	Improper recognition of Impairment Loss for Receivables-Disallowances/ Charges and Other Receivables	0.323	Unrecorded deliveries from PS-DBM	123.755	Unrecorded issuances/disposal/loss/ transfer of inventory/semi-expendable property or Report of Materials and Supplies Issued (RSMI)	5.002	Erroneous recording of Inventory transactions/misclassification of accounts/abnormal or negative balances	7.023	Unrecorded purchases of PPEs	4.613	<p>We reiterated our prior year's recommendation that Management require the:</p> <p>a. Accountants of CO, BMB, ROs III, IV-B, V, VI, VIII, XII and 35 PENROs to effect the necessary adjustment on the errors/omissions to correct the balances of the affected accounts in the FS with supporting documents;</p> <p>b. Accountants and/or Cashier of NCR, LMB, ROs VI, XII and PENRO Leyte to comply with the maintenance of individual SL for each type of fund; prioritize the analysis and reconciliation of the cash account against its corresponding trust liabilities accounts for proper disposition of variances and prepare adjusting entry, when necessary; and make a representation to the Unit in the DENR CO specifically concerned with FAPs, to inquire on the origin of the funds including pertinent documents related to the non-existent and unaccounted cash balances; consider requesting relief from accountability which can no longer accounted for due to loss of money and pertinent records caused by fire;</p> <p>c. Accountants of CO and RO II facilitate the reconciliation of the difference</p>		
Error/Omission	Amount (in million PhP)																							
Unrecorded/delayed recording of bank accounts/ deposits/check disbursements/ refunds/ fund transfers/ reconciling items and other transactions	0.279																							
Non-cancellation of stale checks/unreleased checks not restored to Cash account; signed blank checks; dishonored checks; non-disposal of unused obsolete checks	0.400																							
Erroneous recording of receivables	24.813																							
Unrecorded/unbooked receivables	38.134																							
Improper recognition of Impairment Loss for Receivables-Disallowances/ Charges and Other Receivables	0.323																							
Unrecorded deliveries from PS-DBM	123.755																							
Unrecorded issuances/disposal/loss/ transfer of inventory/semi-expendable property or Report of Materials and Supplies Issued (RSMI)	5.002																							
Erroneous recording of Inventory transactions/misclassification of accounts/abnormal or negative balances	7.023																							
Unrecorded purchases of PPEs	4.613																							

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder																																
	<table><tr><td>Unrecorded donated/transferred PPEs received by the Agency</td><td>3.374</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded disposal/transfer of PPEs or lost/destroyed/donated properties to other agencies</td><td>20.415</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded confiscated motor vehicles with finality decision</td><td>0.419</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous/misclassification of PPE</td><td>993.206</td></tr><tr><td>Non-recognition of major repairs as PPE</td><td>6.788</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous/failure to recognize depreciation of PPEs or non-provision of impairment loss</td><td>235.569</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecouped Advances to Contractors</td><td>1.678</td></tr><tr><td>Non-impairment of Other Assets</td><td>1.568</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous/unrecorded Intangible/Other Assets or misclassification of accounts</td><td>133.222</td></tr><tr><td>Non-derecognition of non-existent/destroyed/damaged/disposed/donated Other Assets</td><td>5.913</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded/erroneously recorded payables</td><td>15.914</td></tr><tr><td>Unaccounted/unrecorded/unrealized revenues or income</td><td>0.114</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous recording of revenues/income/ misclassification of accounts</td><td>0.796</td></tr><tr><td>Erroneous recording of expenses or misclassification of accounts</td><td>6.902</td></tr><tr><td>Unrecorded Expenses</td><td>0.536</td></tr><tr><td><b>TOTAL</b></td><td><b>1,630.756</b></td></tr></table>	Unrecorded donated/transferred PPEs received by the Agency	3.374	Unrecorded disposal/transfer of PPEs or lost/destroyed/donated properties to other agencies	20.415	Unrecorded confiscated motor vehicles with finality decision	0.419	Erroneous/misclassification of PPE	993.206	Non-recognition of major repairs as PPE	6.788	Erroneous/failure to recognize depreciation of PPEs or non-provision of impairment loss	235.569	Unrecouped Advances to Contractors	1.678	Non-impairment of Other Assets	1.568	Erroneous/unrecorded Intangible/Other Assets or misclassification of accounts	133.222	Non-derecognition of non-existent/destroyed/damaged/disposed/donated Other Assets	5.913	Unrecorded/erroneously recorded payables	15.914	Unaccounted/unrecorded/unrealized revenues or income	0.114	Erroneous recording of revenues/income/ misclassification of accounts	0.796	Erroneous recording of expenses or misclassification of accounts	6.902	Unrecorded Expenses	0.536	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,630.756</b>	<p>between the balances per books and those as confirmed and prepare the necessary adjusting entries to reflect the correct balance of the receivable accounts;</p> <p>d. Accountants of CO, LMB, NCR, ROs VI, XI, PENROs Samar and Davao de Oro to assess the collectability of all dormant/long outstanding receivables whether it has objective evidence to be impaired and provide an Allowance for Impairment, if warranted. If no longer collectible, re-apply/file the request for authority to write-off dormant receivables, taking into consideration the deficiencies noted by the COA following the provisions of COA Circular No. 2016-005 dated December 19, 2016;</p> <p>e. Accountants of CO, NCR and RO VI to identify the details of the outstanding fund transfer and fast-track the retrieval of documents needed in the verification and analysis of the undocumented/unsupported outstanding receivables;</p> <p>f. Accountant of PENRO Biliran to correctly present the Receivable-Due from LGUs account as non-current assets in the Statement of Financial Position in compliance with Section 24, Chapter 2 and Section 16, Chapter 19, both of GAM Volume I;</p> <p>g. Accountants and/or Property Officers of CO, LMB, ROs CAR, III, IV-A, IV-B, V, VI, XI and 30 PENROs to maintain and update accounting and property records/reports and complete the</p>		
Unrecorded donated/transferred PPEs received by the Agency	3.374																																			
Unrecorded disposal/transfer of PPEs or lost/destroyed/donated properties to other agencies	20.415																																			
Unrecorded confiscated motor vehicles with finality decision	0.419																																			
Erroneous/misclassification of PPE	993.206																																			
Non-recognition of major repairs as PPE	6.788																																			
Erroneous/failure to recognize depreciation of PPEs or non-provision of impairment loss	235.569																																			
Unrecouped Advances to Contractors	1.678																																			
Non-impairment of Other Assets	1.568																																			
Erroneous/unrecorded Intangible/Other Assets or misclassification of accounts	133.222																																			
Non-derecognition of non-existent/destroyed/damaged/disposed/donated Other Assets	5.913																																			
Unrecorded/erroneously recorded payables	15.914																																			
Unaccounted/unrecorded/unrealized revenues or income	0.114																																			
Erroneous recording of revenues/income/ misclassification of accounts	0.796																																			
Erroneous recording of expenses or misclassification of accounts	6.902																																			
Unrecorded Expenses	0.536																																			
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,630.756</b>																																			
CAAR CY 2022 par. 1	<p><b>Accounting Deficiencies</b></p> <p>Various accounting deficiencies such as non-maintenance of Subsidiary Ledgers (SLs), unreconciled differences among accounting reports, and unreconciled variances between accounting and property records on the five assets and liability accounts with an aggregated</p>																																			



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder																																
	<p>amount of ₱8,616.757 million, affected the fair presentation of the FS.</p> <table><thead><tr><th>Deficiencies</th><th>Amount (in million PhP)</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Unreconciled, dormant, unsupported and non-existent cash account balance</td><td>30.359</td></tr><tr><td>Non-maintenance of SLs for each type of fund of cash account</td><td>7.488</td></tr><tr><td>Unreconciled receivables between GL and confirmations</td><td>74.859</td></tr><tr><td>Dormant/long-outstanding/ non-moving receivables</td><td>7.561</td></tr><tr><td>Unsupported receivables; lacking information/details/ breakdown; unadjusted receivables;</td><td>4.145</td></tr><tr><td>Non-recognition of impairment loss for dormant receivables</td><td>135.471</td></tr><tr><td>Non-Current Receivables presented in the FS as Current Receivables</td><td>0.743</td></tr><tr><td>Non- maintenance/updating of Subsidiary Ledger Cards (SLCs) or Stock Cards (SCs) by the Accounting and Property Offices, respectively</td><td>6.371</td></tr><tr><td>Unreconciled with RPCI/ RPCSP</td><td>24.031</td></tr><tr><td>Incomplete/non-conduct of physical count and/or non-preparation of RPCI</td><td>7.728</td></tr><tr><td>Non-adoption of perpetual inventory method</td><td>2.682</td></tr><tr><td>Undocumented/unsupported PPE transactions due to the absence of or failure to update PPELC and SLCs /Schedules supporting the GLs, or any accounting records or certificate of ownership</td><td>2,946.288</td></tr><tr><td>Incomplete/failure to conduct physical inventory of PPEs</td><td>1,374.213</td></tr><tr><td>Unaccounted PPE during physical count</td><td>2.390</td></tr><tr><td>Non-preparation/maintenance/ updating or submission of required PPE reports/records (PLCs, PCs, RPCPPE)</td><td>75.931</td></tr></tbody></table>	Deficiencies	Amount (in million PhP)	Unreconciled, dormant, unsupported and non-existent cash account balance	30.359	Non-maintenance of SLs for each type of fund of cash account	7.488	Unreconciled receivables between GL and confirmations	74.859	Dormant/long-outstanding/ non-moving receivables	7.561	Unsupported receivables; lacking information/details/ breakdown; unadjusted receivables;	4.145	Non-recognition of impairment loss for dormant receivables	135.471	Non-Current Receivables presented in the FS as Current Receivables	0.743	Non- maintenance/updating of Subsidiary Ledger Cards (SLCs) or Stock Cards (SCs) by the Accounting and Property Offices, respectively	6.371	Unreconciled with RPCI/ RPCSP	24.031	Incomplete/non-conduct of physical count and/or non-preparation of RPCI	7.728	Non-adoption of perpetual inventory method	2.682	Undocumented/unsupported PPE transactions due to the absence of or failure to update PPELC and SLCs /Schedules supporting the GLs, or any accounting records or certificate of ownership	2,946.288	Incomplete/failure to conduct physical inventory of PPEs	1,374.213	Unaccounted PPE during physical count	2.390	Non-preparation/maintenance/ updating or submission of required PPE reports/records (PLCs, PCs, RPCPPE)	75.931	<p>physical inventory taking to reconcile the variances between the SLC and RPCI for inventory accounts; SPLC and RPCSP for semi-expendable accounts; and PPELC and RPCPPE for PPE accounts;</p> <p>h. Accountants of PENROs Marinduque, Agusan del Norte and Surigao del Sur to observe the Perpetual Inventory Method in recording the purchase and issuance of supplies and materials in accordance with Section 9, Chapter 8 of GAM for NGAs, Volume I;</p> <p>i. Accountants of LMB and 13 PENROs to locate records/supporting documents to substantiate the balances of the affected accounts; reconcile and update the entries in the SLs to determine the causes of the discrepancy between the accounting and concerned divisions records for Intangible and Other Assets accounts; conduct physical count for the Confiscated Property/Assets to establish its existence; and disclose the relevant information in the Notes to FS;</p> <p>j. Accountants of LMB, PENROs Pampanga, Iloilo, Guimaras, Davao de Oro and Davao Oriental to make necessary reversion to the Accumulated Surplus/(Deficit) account the undocumented and without actual and valid claims filed for settlement which has been outstanding for two years or more as prescribed under COA-DBM JC No. 1, series of 2021; file a request to the COA for authority to write-off dormant unliquidated fund transfers from other</p>		
Deficiencies	Amount (in million PhP)																																			
Unreconciled, dormant, unsupported and non-existent cash account balance	30.359																																			
Non-maintenance of SLs for each type of fund of cash account	7.488																																			
Unreconciled receivables between GL and confirmations	74.859																																			
Dormant/long-outstanding/ non-moving receivables	7.561																																			
Unsupported receivables; lacking information/details/ breakdown; unadjusted receivables;	4.145																																			
Non-recognition of impairment loss for dormant receivables	135.471																																			
Non-Current Receivables presented in the FS as Current Receivables	0.743																																			
Non- maintenance/updating of Subsidiary Ledger Cards (SLCs) or Stock Cards (SCs) by the Accounting and Property Offices, respectively	6.371																																			
Unreconciled with RPCI/ RPCSP	24.031																																			
Incomplete/non-conduct of physical count and/or non-preparation of RPCI	7.728																																			
Non-adoption of perpetual inventory method	2.682																																			
Undocumented/unsupported PPE transactions due to the absence of or failure to update PPELC and SLCs /Schedules supporting the GLs, or any accounting records or certificate of ownership	2,946.288																																			
Incomplete/failure to conduct physical inventory of PPEs	1,374.213																																			
Unaccounted PPE during physical count	2.390																																			
Non-preparation/maintenance/ updating or submission of required PPE reports/records (PLCs, PCs, RPCPPE)	75.931																																			

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder																										
	<table><tr><td>Unreconciled PPE balances between Accounting and Property records</td><td>3,635.841</td></tr><tr><td>Dormant/long outstanding prepayments and other assets</td><td>12.296</td></tr><tr><td>Unreconciled balances between the accounts and other accounting/property reports of Other Assets accounts</td><td>1.858</td></tr><tr><td>Lack of supporting documents, records and/or physical count; records not properly maintained such as SLs, Report of Physical Count</td><td>64.429</td></tr><tr><td>Non-disclosure of required information in the Notes to the Financial Statements</td><td>3.171</td></tr><tr><td>Dormant/long-outstanding/unsupported payables, unidentified liabilities</td><td>36.689</td></tr><tr><td>Absence of SL and/or unreconciled with GL of payable accounts</td><td>82.211</td></tr><tr><td>Negative/abnormal payable balances</td><td>5.514</td></tr><tr><td>Discrepancies between account balance and other reports for liabilities such as Aging Schedule, Summary Report on the Inter-Agency Payables, Schedule of Accounts Payable, and other account balances, etc.</td><td>7.036</td></tr><tr><td>Not restated balances of CY 2021 corresponding figures presented in the CY 2022 FS</td><td>5.630</td></tr><tr><td>Different balance of Statement of Changes in Net Assets/Equity from the ending balance last year</td><td>43.140</td></tr><tr><td>Variance between the FS/SL and GL balances</td><td>18.679</td></tr><tr><td><b>TOTAL</b></td><td><b>8,619.757</b></td></tr></table>	Unreconciled PPE balances between Accounting and Property records	3,635.841	Dormant/long outstanding prepayments and other assets	12.296	Unreconciled balances between the accounts and other accounting/property reports of Other Assets accounts	1.858	Lack of supporting documents, records and/or physical count; records not properly maintained such as SLs, Report of Physical Count	64.429	Non-disclosure of required information in the Notes to the Financial Statements	3.171	Dormant/long-outstanding/unsupported payables, unidentified liabilities	36.689	Absence of SL and/or unreconciled with GL of payable accounts	82.211	Negative/abnormal payable balances	5.514	Discrepancies between account balance and other reports for liabilities such as Aging Schedule, Summary Report on the Inter-Agency Payables, Schedule of Accounts Payable, and other account balances, etc.	7.036	Not restated balances of CY 2021 corresponding figures presented in the CY 2022 FS	5.630	Different balance of Statement of Changes in Net Assets/Equity from the ending balance last year	43.140	Variance between the FS/SL and GL balances	18.679	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>8,619.757</b>	<p>government agencies following the provisions of COA Circular No. 2016-005 dated December 19, 2016; and fast track the performance evaluation of completed reforestation projects to avoid long outstanding Guaranty/Security Deposits Payable account;</p> <p>k. Accountants of LMB, NCR, ROs V, VI, PENROs Romblon, Eastern Samar and Leyte to facilitate the maintenance of SL and reconcile with GL and other reports to avoid negative/abnormal balance of the land and payable accounts;</p> <p>l. Accountant of PENRO Romblon to properly present prior period errors and adjustments by restating the prior year balances of the affected accounts shown as corresponding figures for the current year FS in compliance with the requirements of Section 42(b) and 43 of GAM for NGAs, Volume 1; and</p> <p>m. Accountants of RO IV-B and PENRO Davao de Oro to submit satisfactory explanation for the changes in the beginning balance of the Statement of Changes in Net Asset/Equity for All Funds despite the absence of adjustments for CY 2021; and obtain the balances of accounts from the GL for FS presentation/reporting to rule out discrepancies.</p>		
Unreconciled PPE balances between Accounting and Property records	3,635.841																													
Dormant/long outstanding prepayments and other assets	12.296																													
Unreconciled balances between the accounts and other accounting/property reports of Other Assets accounts	1.858																													
Lack of supporting documents, records and/or physical count; records not properly maintained such as SLs, Report of Physical Count	64.429																													
Non-disclosure of required information in the Notes to the Financial Statements	3.171																													
Dormant/long-outstanding/unsupported payables, unidentified liabilities	36.689																													
Absence of SL and/or unreconciled with GL of payable accounts	82.211																													
Negative/abnormal payable balances	5.514																													
Discrepancies between account balance and other reports for liabilities such as Aging Schedule, Summary Report on the Inter-Agency Payables, Schedule of Accounts Payable, and other account balances, etc.	7.036																													
Not restated balances of CY 2021 corresponding figures presented in the CY 2022 FS	5.630																													
Different balance of Statement of Changes in Net Assets/Equity from the ending balance last year	43.140																													
Variance between the FS/SL and GL balances	18.679																													
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>8,619.757</b>																													
Compliance Audit																														
CAAR CY 2022 par. 2	<p><b>Utilization/obligation of fund and disbursement</b></p> <p>Overall, the agency's appropriation/allotment for CY 2022 of ₱20,757.067</p>	<p>We reiterated our prior year's recommendation that Management:</p> <p>a. maximize the utilization of the allotments in order to avoid reversal of</p>																												



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	million, the amount of ₱20,034.598 million or 96.52 percent was utilized/obligated and ₱18,121.193 million or 90.45 percent was disbursed until December 31, 2022. Moreover, of the total cash allocation of ₱20,865.346 million, 97.76 percent or ₱20,397.149 million was disbursed, leaving a balance of ₱468.225 million, of which ₱455.799 million was reverted back to the BTr, thus projects targeted for implementation during the year were not immediately implemented.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>unutilized allotments; and to be able to deliver optimum services to the intended beneficiaries;</li> <li>b. provide the detailed remedial action plan to reflect the specific measures to be undertaken to resolve the identified issues to ensure attainment of physical and financial targets; and</li> <li>c. ensure the timely execution/implementation of the projects/programs and project to be able to attain its objective in a timely manner and avoid the automatic reversion of program appropriations to the BTr and to deliver optimum services to the intended beneficiaries.</li> </ul>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 3	<p><b><i>Unliquidated fund transfers to Implementing Agencies (IAs)</i></b></p> <p>Fund transfers to Implementing Agencies (IAs) during the year and for prior years for the implementation of projects of 3 Staff Bureaus, 5 ROs and 10 PENROs amounting to ₱155.497 million or 50.01 percent of the total funds transferred of ₱310.937 million were not liquidated as of year-end due to: (a) failure of the IAs to perform its obligation as stipulated in the MOA, (b) suspension of projects, and (c) absence of liquidation reports, thus, the existence of enormous balance of fund transfers.</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the Accountants of LMB, BMB, ERDB, NCR and ROs I, III, IV-A, VI and 10 PENROs to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. strictly enforce the period of liquidation as prescribed in COA Circular No. 94-013 dated December 13, 1994 and adopt mechanisms to avoid long outstanding of unliquidated fund transfers; and</li> <li>b. to continue sending regularly demand letters and make a representation with the heads of the concerned IAs, for the submission of the liquidation documents of fund transfers and the return of the unexpended balances of all completed projects, if any.</li> </ul>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 4	<p><b><i>Unliquidated cash advances</i></b></p> <p>Cash advances amounting to ₱11.218 million or 9.87 percent of the total cash advances granted of ₱113.653 million</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the Accountants of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. LMB and RO XII to validate the propriety of the long outstanding</li> </ul>		

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	<p>were not liquidated in the LMB, 1 RO and 3 PENROs at year-end due to the non-enforcement of settlement/liquidation of outstanding cash advances within the prescribed period, thus, exposes government funds to possible misuse.</p>	<p>balances and those records in the books in the lump sum amount and request for write off for those balances existing for over ten years as required in COA Circular No. COA Circular No. 2016-005 dated December 19, 2016 ;</p> <p>b. PENROs Isabela, Palawan and Aklan to enforce strictly the liquidation of cash advances within the prescribed period by requiring the AOs to liquidate immediately their cash advances as soon as the purpose for which it was granted has already been served and the immediate refund/return of any excess amount thereof;</p> <p>c. RO XII to communicate and verify from the nearest of kin of the identified AOs/SDOs with unliquidated cash advances of more than 10 years to ascertain their whereabouts and whether or not there is truth in the claims of their deaths, as this may support the request for write-off;</p> <p>d. RO XII to refrain from granting clearance of money and property accountabilities for employees who are to retire or to be transferred to other offices, unless they have fully settled or liquidated their money accountabilities; correspond with the personnel who have been transferred or already retired regarding their unliquidated balances; and substantiate the unaccounted Advances to Officers and Employees pertaining to the prior cash advances, and, if unable to do so, submit a certification and justification with proofs</p>		



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
		<p>as to the circumstances attending the difficulties; and</p> <p>e. PENRO Aklan see to it that proper timeline/cut-off of granting cash advances at year-end is imposed to give ample time for the Accountable Officers to disburse all the cash and liquidate the same, within the period prescribed by rules and regulations, as well as to avoid possible reversion of unobligated cash balance.</p>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 5	<p><b><i>Receipt and utilization and implementation of FAPs and ODA Funded Projects</i></b></p> <p><b><i>a. Forestland Management Project</i></b></p> <p>In CY 2022, the Project showed an overall utilization rate of 78.94 percent and the overall disbursements rate is only 56.79 percent. Likewise, of the nine targeted outputs, two were not completed specifically the Land Tenure Issuance (LTI) and Construction of Agroforestry Support Facilities (ASF) projects due to various reasons, thus, attainment of the overall project's objective/purpose was delayed.</p> <p>Also, of the 149 established enterprises/livelihoods by the partner People's Organizations (POs), only 84 enterprises or 56 percent were operational; thus, the project's objective to strengthen forestland management through community-based management strategies on enterprise development for</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the Project Head of FMP to:</p> <p>a. follow up with JICA on the release of revolving fund for the project disbursement and the issuance of NOL for the procurement of an engineering firm to undertake the construction supervision of the remaining ASF subprojects;</p> <p>b. continuously coordinate with the NCIP with regards to the conduct of the necessary FPIC process; and</p> <p>c. monitor the implementation of the PO Enterprise Development sustainability plan to ensure that the established enterprises/livelihood projects will be sustained for food security and income of the POs.</p>	<p>The Management commented that:</p> <p>a. Relative to the Project's request for the release of additional revolving funds, a letter has been submitted to the oversight agencies on March 22, 2023, together with the request of project extension up to July 2024, with a requested amount of JPY 300M. This will facilitate and improve the financial performance of the Project vis-à-vis its disbursement projection up to December 2023.</p> <p>b. On the procurement of the Engineering Firm, it is no longer feasible to be pursued given that the project is until June 2023 only and the required concurrence from JICA has yet to be issued. In view of this, the engaged Infrastructure Specialist (IS) and Assisting Professionals (APs) for Infrastructure Works will undertake the construction supervision of the Agroforestry Value Chain (AfVC) Facilities such as tramline and processing/storage facilities and the</p>	

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	food security and income were not fully attained.		<p>remaining under construction ASF subprojects.</p> <p>c. All FPIC processes for the remaining 48 LTIs in Region VI and CAR were already completed, awaiting for the issuance of the required NCIP clearances as prerequisite for LTI issuance. The PIUs shall continue to its close coordination with the Central/Regional/Provincial NCIPs to facilitate acquisition of said clearances. Issuance of provisional agreements before end of project pursuant to the provisions of DAO 2021-27 is another strategy of the Project in the case that the required NCIP clearances will not be secured within the project life. The Project will also coordinate with JICA for the possible reduction of target considering that 14 POs in Ifugao have already been accredited as members of the Indigenous Peoples Organization (IPOs), hence will no longer pursue their respective CBFMA applications, and instead wait for the approval of its Certificate of Ancestral Domain Title (CADT) application.</p> <p>d. Regarding the implementation of 149 livelihood/microenterprises of Peoples Organizations under the Project, continuous monitoring is being conducted to ensure that POs businesses will be operationalized and sustained. Based on the assessment conducted in CY 2021,</p>	



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
			these enterprises were categorized based on its status whether for upscaling, continuing, or recommended for change/shift to another viable enterprise. Provision of technical assistance based on this categorization was incorporated in the respective Enterprise Sustainability Plans of the POs which serve as guide for the Project on what type of assistance is needed by the POs. Continuing activities such as monitoring, and provision of technical assistance were already considered in the project phase out plan and shall be implemented under the regular activities and program of the DENR.	
CAAR CY 2022 par. 6	<p><b><i>b. Integrated Natural Resources and Environmental Management Project</i></b></p> <p>The DENR - Foreign Assisted and Special Projects Service (FASPS) did not comply with the provision on the submission of the Completion Report for Integrated Natural Resources and Environmental Management Project (INREMP) as stated in the General Conditions for Agricultural Development Financing as amended in September 2010 which precluded the Audit Team to assess and evaluate the physical and financial accomplishment of the Project.</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the Head of FASPS to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>fast track the finalization of the Completion Report for proper assessment and evaluation of both the Audit Team and the ADB;</li> <li>monitor the cancellation of the unused loan to avoid continuous charging of commitment fees; and</li> <li>henceforth, ensure that project work-related reports and documents are properly turned over by the outgoing project staff to a permanent employee of FASPS.</li> </ol>		

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	Likewise, the non-reversion of the unutilized loan amount of INREMP caused the government commitment fees of ₱0.269 million in CY 2022 due to delayed action of the DENR to cancel the undisbursed loan amount with the ADB upon completion of the project, which is disadvantageous to the government.			
CAAR CY 2022 par. 8	<p><b><i>Non-Compliance with Republic Act (RA) No. 9184 and its Revised IRR on the procurement activities and pursuant to COA Circular Nos. 2009-001 and 2012-001</i></b></p> <p>Procurement activities from the DENR-CO, 15 PENROs, 3 ROs, and 2 FAPS-FMP amounting to ₱88.828 million were associated with various deficiencies required by the aforementioned law, rules and regulations, thus the validity and propriety of the transactions could not be established and the price most advantageous to the government may not be obtained.</p>	We recommended that Management instruct the BAC of CO, ROs I, IV-B and V, PENROs Abra, Kalinga, Pangasinan, Nueva Vizcaya, Quirino, Leyte, Eastern Samar, Davao Oriental, Davao De Oro, Agusan Del Norte, Agusan Del Sur, Surigao Del Norte, Surigao Del Sur and Dinagat Islands and FAPS-FMP to ensure that procurement activities are in accordance with RA No. 9184 and its Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations (RIRR) and to submit the lacking supporting documents for audit.		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 9	<p><b><i>Non-submission of copies of contracts within set timeline</i></b></p> <p>Out of 8,948 copies of government contracts and 4,007 Purchase Orders (POs) amounting to ₱1,561.133 million and ₱286.974 million, respectively, only 6,009 contracts and 2,059 POs amounting to ₱999.085 million and ₱151.669 million were submitted on time. The DENR CO, 2 staff bureaus, 4 ROs, 15 PENROs and FAPS-FMP of Iloilo failed to submit 2,887 contracts</p>	<p>We reiterated our prior year's recommendation that Management direct the Heads of the DENR CO, BMB, FMB, NCR, ROs IV-A, V, VI, 16 PENROs and FAPS-FMP of Iloilo to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>maintain an updated monitoring system on the submission of contracts/PO, and check periodically the status of such submission;</li> <li>properly endorse the task of submission of contracts to the alternate staff in case of unavailability of the person-in-charge; and</li> </ol>		



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	and 1,877 POs amounting to ₱560.925 million and ₱134.528 million, respectively, within the prescribed period, with delays ranging from 1 to 725 days, while 52 contracts and 71 POs amounting to ₱1.123 million and ₱0.776 million, respectively, were not submitted; thus, precluding the audit teams of timely review and evaluation and the detection of any deficiency that could be rectified immediately.	c. submit copies of perfected contracts/purchase orders within the prescribed timeline.		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 13	<p><b><i>Unsettled suspensions, disallowances and charges at year-end</i></b></p> <p>Total settlement of suspensions, disallowances and charges during the year amounted to ₱23.936 million or 7.50 percent out of the total audit suspensions, disallowances and charges of ₱319.036 million, leaving unsettled suspensions, disallowance and charges of ₱45.457 million, ₱176.614 million and ₱73.030 million, respectively, as at year-end.</p>	<p>We reiterated our previous years' recommendation that Management direct all DENR Offices to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. ensure compliance with laws, rules and regulations to avoid audit suspensions, disallowances and charges;</li> <li>b. adhere to the provisions of the RRSA as prescribed under COA Circular No. 2009-006 dated September 15, 2009, requiring the settlement of suspensions, disallowances and charges within the prescribed period to prevent accumulation of unsettled NSs, NDs and NCs; and</li> <li>c. send demand letters to all persons responsible/liable for audit disallowances/charges with issued NFDs and COEs and enforce the immediate full settlement pursuant to the RRSA thru the Accountants of concerned DENR offices.</li> </ul>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 14	<p><b><i>Non-compliance with BIR provisions</i></b></p> <p>Taxes withheld by LMB, RO VI and four PENROs were not remitted properly</p>	<p>We recommended that the Management require:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The Accountants of LMB, RO VI, and the four PENROs to:</li> </ul>		

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	during the year resulting to over-remittance of ₱0.280 million and under-remittance amounting to ₱2.086 million due to inability of the respective Accountants to monitor and reconcile fully the amount withheld, thus exposing the Department and payees/suppliers/contractors to risks of penalty imposition.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Prioritize and expedite the reconciliation of the account "Due to BIR" and make a monthly report on the reconciliation made, copy furnished to the Office of the Auditor;</li> <li>ii. See to it that reconciliation of taxes withheld and remitted are made monthly and taxes withheld are remitted intact within the prescribed period by properly monitoring the persons in charge.</li> </ul> <p>b. The Accountants of RO VI and PENROs Romblon and Iloilo to remit the under-remitted taxes once the reconciliation is done in order to avoid further penalties.</p>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 15	<p><b><i>Non-compliance with the provisions of GSIS Law</i></b></p> <p>GSIS employees' shares and loan amortizations of LMB, RO VI and four PENROs were not remitted properly resulting in over-remittance of ₱0.058 million and under-remittance of ₱0.200 million due to non-reconciliation of the amounts withheld and remitted, thus exposing the Department to penalty impositions and the employees to deprivation of full use of service/benefits of GSIS. Further, prior year's balance of RO VI amounting to ₱0.407 million remained unremitted as of year-end.</p>	<p>We recommended that Management require the Accountant of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. LMB, RO VI and the four PENROs to ensure that monthly Pag-IBIG contributions and loan amortizations withheld are reconciled so that these are remitted intact and without delay;</li> <li>b. RO VI, PENROs Abra, Romblon and Marinduque immediately the unremitted balances and shoulder the penalties and interest in their personal capacities and refund to the respective employees the amount of over-withholding, if any; and</li> <li>c. RO VI to prioritize the analysis and reconciliation of the prior years' balances of Due to GSIS account for proper disposition.</li> </ul>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 16	<p><b><i>Non-compliance with the provisions of Pag-IBIG Law</i></b></p>	<p>We recommended that Management require the Accountant of:</p>		



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	The Pag-IBIG Employees' shares and loan amortizations of LMB, RO VI and two PENROs were not remitted properly resulting to over-remittance amounting to ₱0.078 million and unremitted balances of ₱0.013 million as at year-end which are subject to reconciliation. Further, prior years' balances of RO VI and PENRO Abra amounting to ₱0.119 million and ₱0.035 million, respectively, remained unremitted as of year-end. Thus the delay of remittances may result to imposition of penalties and timely processing of employees' claims and possible forfeiture of benefits.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LMB, RO VI and PENROs Romblon and Iloilo to ensure that monthly Pag-IBIG contributions and loan amortizations withheld are reconciled so that these are remitted intact and without delay;</li> <li>RO VI and PENROs Romblon and Iloilo to remit immediately the unremitted balances and shoulder the penalties and interest in their personal capacities and refund to the respective employees the amount of over-withholding, if any; and</li> <li>RO VI and PENRO Abra to prioritize the analysis and reconciliation of the prior years' balances of Due to Pag-IBIG account for proper disposition.</li> </ol>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 18	<p><b><i>Gender and Development (GAD)</i></b></p> <p>Although DENR allocated ₱1,676.807 million or 6.63 percent of the total appropriations of ₱25,295.589 million for GAD programs and activities, deficiencies were noted in 1 RO and 3 PENROs such as (i) non-submission of individual GAD Plan and Budget (GPB) and GAD Accomplishment Reports (ARs), (ii) overstatement of GPB and GAD AR, (iii) non-submission of GPB to Central Office for review and endorsement, and (iv) failure to comply on prescribed format of GAD AR with fund utilization of only ₱1,130.878 million of the allocated funds, due to various reasons, thus the extent of the gender-responsiveness of the agency's policies, programs, and projects as well as the reliability of the information</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the GAD Focal Person of:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>RO II and PENRO Cagayan to participate in orientations on GAD-related laws and commitments, if necessary, for better understanding of the preparation and implementation of the individual GAD Plan and Budget as well as its corresponding GAD Accomplishment Report;</li> <li>PENRO Oriental Mindoro: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>to refrain from using estimates in filling-up the actual expenditures in the GAD AR and henceforth, coordinate with the Accounting Unit for the actual disbursements made;</li> <li>use the HGDG assessment scores as basis in the determination of the allowed amount of budget and actual</li> </ul> </li> </ol>		

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	presented in the GPB could not be ascertained.	<p>expenditures that may be attributed to GPB and GAD AR;</p> <p>c. PENRO Eastern Samar to create a GAD Focal Point System and such can only be achieved through enjoining the unit heads to attend seminars and trainings related thereto;</p> <p>d. RO II, PENROs Cagayan and Eastern Samar to use the prescribed format of Annual GAD GPB and Annual GAD AR of PCW-NEDA-DBM Joint Circular 2012-1; and</p> <p>e. RO II to assume greater responsibility in record keeping, monitoring and evaluation of all PAPs included in the GAD Plan and Budget to properly consolidate and to cause prompt submission of reports.</p>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 19	<p><b><i>Non-compliance with provisions of the GAA for Senior Citizens and Persons with Disability (SCPD)</i></b></p> <p>Two PENROs did not allocate budget nor formulate any plans, projects and programs intended for the benefit of SCPD for CY 2022.</p>	We recommended that Management instruct the Heads of PENROs Leyte and Samar to formulate and implement plans, projects and programs for the elderly and differently-abled persons.		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 21	<p><b><i>Non-Compliance with COA Circular No. 92-390 on the Inventory of Physical Assets, Insurance and Bonding of Risks with the General Insurance Fund of the GSIS</i></b></p> <p>Physical assets of CO, ROs CAR, IV-B, XII and 6 PENROs in the total amount of ₱535.496 million were not insured against fire or theft with the General Insurance Fund (GIF) of the GSIS, thus,</p>	<p>We recommended that Management direct the Property and Supply Officers of:</p> <p>a. CO to stop the practice of basing the PIF submitted to GSIS on the individual PIFs per office and extract the PIF based on the preceding RPCPPE instead, taking into consideration the additions/procurements made during the period and excluding lost/missing and impaired properties for disposal in order</p>		



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	said Offices are risk of not being indemnified in case of damage or loss of the assets.	<p>to properly identify all the insurable assets;</p> <p>b. CO to conduct capacity building/trainings on the proper process of preparation of PIF which serves as the basis for insurance of the physical assets with the GSIS as the foregoing audit observations had been a perineal issue in the DENR-CO which results in both overpayment of insurance premiums for several PPE items and failure to insure several PPE items which are disadvantageous to the Department;</p> <p>c. CAR and CAR-INREMP to promptly process the insurance of the properties with the GIF of the GSIS;</p> <p>d. CO, ROs IV-B, XII, PENROs Abra, Iloilo, Iloilo-FMP, Negros Occidental and Sarangani to update the PIF once the RPCPPE for the period covered is available and ensure that all insurable properties are insured with the GSIS; and</p> <p>e. PENROs Benguet and Eastern Samar to provide the necessary budget for the insurance premium sufficient to cover all insurable assets and cause the application for insurance thereof in faithful compliance with Section 5 of RA No. 656.</p>		
CAAR CY 2022 par. 22	<p><b><i>Dormant/unutilized funds or unauthorized bank accounts/deposits unreverted to the BTr or unreturned to Source Agencies</i></b></p> <p>PENRO Aklan failed to revert to the General Fund its unused cash amounting to ₱7.304 million as of year-end, thus,</p>	We recommended that Management direct the Heads of RO XIII and PENROs Aklan and Samar to require the Accountants to close the unauthorized bank accounts and remit/revert its balances together with the dormant cash and unnecessary funds to the General Fund/the project partner.		

Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	the government was deprived of the available funds that could be used in its priority programs and projects. Further, Region XIII and PENRO Northern Samar continue to maintain unauthorized bank accounts with balances amounting to ₱0.113 million and ₱0.015 million, respectively, thereby, exposing the fund to the risk of being misused.			
<b>Program, Project, Activity Evaluation</b>				
CAAR CY 2022 par. 23	<p><b><i>Deficiencies in the implementation of the Natural Resources Conservation and Development Program, hence, benefits were not maximized or the objectives were not attained</i></b></p> <p>The DENR achieved only one outcome indicator out of the four or 25 percent and seven out of eight or 87.5 percent of the output indicators under the Natural Resources Conservation and Development Program as of year-end due to ineffective preparation of the individual work and financial plan of each office under the DENR to address various recurring causes/issues identified and other deficiencies in the implementation of the PPAs, depriving the intended beneficiaries of the immediate benefits that will be derived therefrom.</p> <p>Moreover, it has utilized the amount of ₱11,193.320 million or 96.60 percent of the total budget/allotment and disbursed the amount of ₱10,270.416 million or</p>	<p>We recommended that Management:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>direct the head of the Policy and Planning Service to revisit the individual targets of each office under the DENR and ensure that all targets will ultimately lead to the accomplishments of the outcome and output indicator pursuant to the GAA prescribed targets;</li> <li>direct the heads of BMB, LMB, and PENRO Davao del Sur to revisit the annual targets and conduct proper planning of activities to ensure accomplishment of the targets on a timely manner;</li> <li>direct the DENR CO for the early release of SAA intended to cover funding for the particular period to ensure sustainable management of protected areas; and</li> <li>direct the heads of DENR RO IV-B, PENRO Oriental Mindoro and RO V to submit satisfactory explanation for charging various amounts not intended for the implementation of the PPAs</li> </ol>		



Reference No.	Observation	Recommendations	Management Comments	Auditor's Rejoinder
	91.75 percent of the total obligations for the said program. Of the disbursed amount, ₱5.595 million or 0.05 percent were not used exclusively for the intended purpose; thus, casting doubt on the regularity and propriety of the expenditures incurred.			