



$\mathbf{4}^{\mathrm{TH}}$ QUARTER GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF CORON BAY WATER QUALITY 1 2 MANAGEMENT AREA (CB WQMA) 3 4 **Minutes of Meeting** 5 6 Date: 06 December 2022 7 Time Started: 9:00 AM 8 Venue: Virtual Meeting via ZOOM 9 10 **ATTENDEES** 11 12 **Present** Represented by 13 **Coron Bay WQMA Governing Board Members** 14 1. Dir. Niño Rey C. Estoya 15 **PCSD** Madrono Cabrestante, Jr. 2. Dir. Niño Rey C. Estoya **PCSD** Serge Lloyd Morallo 16 3. RED Lormelyn E. Claudio Edwin Cac 17 DENR MIMAROPA 18 4. RD Gerald A. Pacanan DPWH MIMAROPA Ernida Quiambao Princess Lalaine Walath 19 5. RD Gerald A. Pacanan DPWH MIMAROPA RD Ma. Josefina P. Albay Katherine Dula 20 DOST MIMAROPA 7. RD Joel B. Valera DTI MIMAROPA Joel Guevarra 21 22 8. RD Bevienne G. Malateo DOT MIMAROPA Faye Reyes 9. RD Agustin C. Mendoza Pamela de Torres 23 NEDA MIMAROPA 10. RD Victoria A. Mendoza Orlan Jabagat 24 PIA MIMAROPA 11. PBGEN Sidney S. Hernia PCOL Adonis B. Guzman 25 PNP MIMAROPA 12. Gov. Victorino Dennis M. Socrates Office of the Governor Leila Dagot 26 Michael Adrian Fababier (MENRO) 27 13. Hon. Mario T. Reyes, Jr. Office of the Mayor Calamianes Association of Tourism Establishments Inc. (CATE) 14. Francisco Fernandez, Jr. 28 29 15. Teodorico De Guia Coron Rural Waterworks and Sanitation (CRWSA) 30 31 **EMB MIMAROPA Personnel** 32 16. Pablito M. Estoque Jr. OIC, Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Division 17. Edna Velasco PEMU - Palawan 33 34 18. Karl Alexander Dammay Chief EMS, Coron 19. Arwin Del Rosario Project Monitoring and Evaluation Officer 35 **Environmental Monitoring Officer** 36 20. Jonald Lenasic 37 21. Maevelyn Kathryn Tupasi **CB WOMA Secretariat** 22. Jane Dumenden **CB WOMA Secretariat** 38 23. Adz Hazen Dimapilis CB WQMA Secretariat 39 24. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora CB WQMA Secretariat 40 41 42 Representatives from the following agency/office members (MIMAROPA Region) were unable to attend the meeting: 43 1. National Water Resources Board (NWRB) 44 45

- 2. Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG)
- 3. Department of Agriculture (DA)
- 4. Department of Education (DepED)
 - 5. Department of Health (DOH)

46

47

48





- 49 6. Commission on Higher Education (CHED)
 - 7. Department of Human Settlement & Urban Development (DHSUD)
 - 8. National Commission on Indigenous People (NCIP)
 - 9. Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR)
 - 10. National Irrigation Administration (NIA)
 - 11. Philippine Coast Guard (PCG)
 - 12. Local Academe
 - 13. Local People's Organization/Civil Society involved in Natural Resources Management or Environmental Concerns

BENB WQMA Members : 27 members Number of Members Present : 14 members Number of Members Absent : 13 members

PROCEEDINGS:

A. Call To Order

The meeting officially started at 9:00 AM, with an opening prayer led by Mr. Adz Hazen Dimapilis, CB WQMA Secretariat. Mr. Dimapilis proceeded in acknowledging the attendees. Ms. Maevelyn Kathryn Tupasi, CB WQMA Secretariat declared the achievement of quorum, having 14 members present out of 27 CB WQMA Governing Board Members.

B. Presentation of the Provisional Agenda

Ms. Tupasi introduced the Provisional Agenda, as follows:

- 1. Presentation / Approval of the Minutes from the Previous Meeting
- 2. Updates on the Issues and Concerns Arising During the Previous Meeting
- 3. Presentation of the Minutes of the Special Meeting with Coron Rural Waterworks and Sanitation Association (CRWSA)
- 4. Presentation of Status of the Medium and Large Scale STP of CRWSA
- 5. Revisit of Coron Bay WQMA Ten-Year Action Plan
- 6. Presentation of the Latest Water Quality Status of Coron Bay
- 7. Other Matters

 The approval of the provisional agenda was moved by Mr. Francisco Fernandez, Jr. of Calamianes Association of Tourism Establishments, Inc. (CATE) and was seconded.

C. Presentation of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

Ms. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora, CB WQMA Secretariat proceeded with the presentation of the minutes of the previous meeting. There were minor corrections made within the minutes which includes:

 1. Revising the surname of Mr. Rodney Verian from DENR CENRO





95 Ms. Pamela De Torres from the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) suggested adding an 96 additional column to represent the head of every agency/organization. Mr. Fernandez, Jr. moved for the approval 97 of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting.

D. Updates on the Issues and Concerns Arising During the Previous Meeting

 Ms. Evora presented the issues and concerns arising from the previous meeting which includes the 1.) Reclamation in Coron Bay, 2.) Status of the Medium and Large Scale STP of Coron Rural Waterworks and Sanitation Association and 3.) Approval of Board Resolution 2022-01: Mobilization of the Committee on Resource Management of CB WQMA and Board Resolution 2022-02: Work and Financial Plan of CB WQMA for CY 2024.

E. Presentation of the Minutes of the Special Meeting with Coron Rural Waterworks and Sanitation Association (CRWSA)

Mr. Karl Alexander Dammay, Chief EMS of Coron presented the minutes of the special meeting conducted with CRWSA. The special meeting was attended by the representatives from CATE, CRWSA, LGU Coron, DENR CENRO Calamianes Islands, and technical personnel of EMB MIMAROPA. The meeting discussed the issues and updates on the Sewage Treatment Plant (STP) in Coron.

The agreement made during the special meeting includes complying with the necessary permits for the operation of STP and following up on the tenurial application in the DENR of Mr. Jovelito R. Vergara of CRWSA. Engr. Michael Adrian Fababier of LGU Coron also requested assistance with their application process for Sanitary Landfill.

 Mr. Teodorico De Guia from CRWSA clarified the statement of Mr. Vergara in their Environmental Compliance Certificate (ECC) application. Based on the agreement between CRWSA and LGU Coron, the CRWSA will submit and process the ECC for the Medium Scale STP, however, the necessary documents for the process will be provided by the LGU Coron. Mr. De Guia stated that according to Engr. Fababier, the LGU Coron will apply Gratuitous Special Land Use Permit (GSLUP) to CENRO. Mr. De Guia also stated that the processing and fees for the ECC Application for the Medium Scale STP will be overseen by the CRWSA. Mr. De Guia also clarified for the Large-Scale STP; the transfer of title is in process in the Registry of Deeds.

F. Presentation of Status of the Medium and Large Scale STP of CRWSA

 Mr. De Guia stated that the requested documents from the previous meeting were unable to be provided due to requested changes of the LGU Coron in the CRWSA's proposal for the Medium Scale STP. He also stated that there was a meeting conducted previously, and the mayor has already made an endorsement for the Sangguniang Bayan. He added that hopefully by December 12, it will be scheduled for discussion in the Sangguniang Bayan, in which the status of the proposal will be discussed before establishing the Memorandum of Agreement.

The CRWSA has requested the Municipal Engineering Office to provide the detailed engineering design and plans of the Medium Scale STP which has not yet been provided. On November 28, CRWSA sent a letter regarding the concern with a copy furnished to the Municipal Engineering Office.

One of the concerns in the operation of the Medium Scale STP was the Return on Investment (ROI) and the share of the LGU as well as the consumer's rate. It was agreed that the Sangguniang Bayan will determine and approve the said rate.





 Regarding the Large-Scale STP, the ECC application has still not yet been submitted as the necessary documents are still in process. Moreover, the trucks to be utilized were already prepared for shipment, however, the agreement was still under negotiation with the Sangguniang Bayan. Ms. Tupasi asked Mr. De Guia what help the governing board could provide. According to Mr. De Guia, the MPDC will apply to CENRO regarding the GSLUP for Proof of Authority over the Project Site, as there was no tenurial in the municipal. As of date, the issue concerning the operation of the STP is the preparation of the documents of the MPDC necessary to initiate its operation. The necessary documents include the Topographic Map of the Impact Affected Area, the Site Development Plan, and the Process Flow Diagram of the Wastewater Treatment Facility.

Mr. Fernandez, Jr. shared that the CATE has assisted the CRWSA in providing data on the water consumption of the hotels which would help the CRWSA to determine their rate. According to Mr. De Guia, the rate of the consumer will be added to the billing. He also stated that the proposed rate for the residential was Php 5.00 per cubic meter, while for the commercial the proposed rate was Php 10.00 per cubic meter.

Mr. De Guia inquired with EMB MIMAROPA if they could perform a pilot testing of the STP for three (3) months, to determine its actual capacity, and possible defects, or if there would be necessary additions in the STP in order to enhance the quality of the water. He also stated that the identified repairs will be shouldered by the CRWSA.

Mr. Fernandez, Jr. asked Mr. De Guia if the rate for the non-CRWSA consumer has the same rate. Mr. De Guia will look into the matter as the said consumers were connected to Mactan Rock and have no billing from CRWSA. Mr. Fernandez Jr. also asked for the timetable for the operationalization of the STP. Mr. De Guia stated that the operation of STP will be based on the processing of the required documents of STP. Engr. Pablito M. Estorque, Jr., OIC of the Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Division (EMED) suggested to Mr. De Guia to provide a written request, stating the specific documents needed, and indicating its timeframe for submission. Mr. De Guia answered that they have already provided the LGU with the list of documents needed last November 28. He also followed up with the MPDC regarding such documents, in which they have compiled five (5) of the requested documents and they are currently processing the GSLUP for the land tenurial.

The representative of MPDO Coron commented on the chat box, that the MPDC was not able to attend due to a prior commitment and in regard to the Large-Scale STP, the national fund from the ADB was withdrawn as the LGU has no means to loan anymore.

Engr. Estorque, Jr. suggested that the EMB send a letter to follow up regarding the stated concerns. However, Ms. Tupasi inquired if the Governing Board could convey the sentiment as the concern was raised during the WQMA GB Meeting.

Ms. Tupasi invited Engr. Czes Bongco, Chief of the Air and Water Permitting Section of EMB, regarding the request raised by Mr. De Guia. Mr. De Guia reiterated their request to have a pilot testing of the STP to determine its capacity and if the quality of water it treats is within the mandates of EMB. They will also apply for Discharge Permit. Engr. Bongco asked for the name of STP and if they have a pending ECC application. Mr. De Guia answered that they still have not yet applied for ECC, as the necessary documents are still being processed in the MPDC.

Engr. Bongco asked Mr. De Guia the percentage of completion of the project. Based on the LGU, the STP has already been turned over from the contractor and it was 100% completed. Engr. Bongco suggested to Engr.





Estorque, Jr. to survey the project in order to provide them with a commissioning period, to which Engr. Estorque, Jr. agreed.

Engr. Bongco added that if the project has approved ECC, they can apply for a temporary Discharge Permit and suggested they should prioritize their ECC Application. The project will be subject to further survey and a technical conference will be conducted. Engr. Bongco stated that the commissioning period has a duration of six (6) months.

Engr. Fababier from MPDC also joined the meeting. Ms. Tupasi asked Engr. Fababier about the timeframe of the processing of the required data. Engr. Fababier states that the needed documents of CRWSA are from the Engineering Office. Mr. De Guia added that the requested data were within the letter provided to the MPDC having a total of nine (9) documents requested.

Engr. Fababier added that the GSLUP was almost complete, and it can probably be finalized in two weeks. He also stated that the required documents will be completed by December. Ms. Tupasi inquired if their requirements are in the Palawan Council for Sustainable Development (PCSD). Engr. Fababier answered that one of the requirements was tenurial, however, the area does not have a tenurial as it was not classified. He inquired if their application for GSLUP could be an alternative for the tenurial. Engr. Madrono Cabrestante, Jr. from PCSD asked if the said concern was regarding the Medium Scale STP, in which Engr. Fababier confirmed. Engr. Cabrestante, Jr. stated the raised concern can be processed as long as it has been discussed.

Engr. Cabrestante, Jr. clarified that if the area is a timberland or unclassified public forest and if the government wants to utilize the area, they must apply for Special Land Use Plan (SLUP) in the Department of Environmental and Natural Resources (DENR) and the PCSD can provide an endorsement before processing it. He also clarified that the tenurial instrument or proof is needed to utilize the land portion.

Engr. Fababier requested help from the DENR to fast-track the necessary documents. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. requested for the MPDO and the DENR to have a meeting about the fast-tracking of the needed requested documents.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. asked for clarification on the commissioning of the Medium-Scale STP, Engr. Bongco clarified that ideally in the commissioning stage, there should be an approved ECC. She also added that if the target of CRWSA is to know the efficiency of the STP, they can be allowed to perform the commissioning of the STP.

Engr. Fababier added that the funds for the large-scale STP were supposed to be loaned. However, due to the many loans of the LGU from other projects such as the public market and the water system, the LGU no longer has the capacity to loan again. The Tourism Infrastructure and Enterprise Zone Authority (TIEZA) sought to take the loan for the LGU, however, it was unknown if the national has agreed on such arrangements.

Ms. Faye Reyes from the Department of Tourism (DOT) stated that the Large-scale STP was under the Sustainable Tourism Development Project (STDP) of the DOT, ADB, TIEZA, and LGUs. She clarified that the Executive Order relative to the STDP under the Tourist Program is for review and has no final arrangement regarding its finances. Currently, they are waiting for directives from their Main Office regarding its implementation. She also confirmed the statement given by Engr. Fababier that TIEZA was supposed to be the one to loan, however there is still no final disposition relative to it.





Mr. Fernandez, Jr. clarified that there were two (2) Large Scale STP to be constructed, one that was supposed to be loaned by the TIEZA which is currently on hold while the other Large Scale STP will be privately owned by the CRWSA. The latter STP was the one that needed the TCT in order to proceed. This was confirmed by Mr. De Guia and they have already submitted their proposal to the municipality to have a joint venture. The CRWSA and Tubig Pilipinas will fund (100 million) the STP and the municipality was not required to provide funds for the project.

Engr. Estorque, Jr. asked about the capacity of the Large-scale STP, he also stated his concern regarding the scattered potential customers of the STP in Guadalupe. He suggested siphoning the areas that were not serviceable as the laying out of the pipes would be time-consuming and expensive. Mr. De Guia agreed as the area is not any more suitable for laying pipes.

Mr. Fernandez, Jr. asked if the CRWSA will siphon wastewater for the commissioning which was confirmed by the CRWSA. The CRWSA also submitted its proposal to have 25% off the official rate during the trial and if they have foreseen a lower cost during the trial, they can further decrease the rate.

Ms. Tupasi reminded Mr. De Guia if they plan to have siphoning services, they must secure Environmental Sanitation Clearance from the DOH.

G. Revisit of Coron Bay WQMA Ten-Year Action Plan

Ms. Jane T. Dumenden, CB WQMA Secretariat presented the Coron Bay WQMA Ten-Year Action Plan. In line with the objective regarding the Elimination of Solid Waste that will eventually discharge to Coron Bay, Mr. De Guia stated that they have a meeting regarding the solid wastes with Poblacion 1 to 6 and Brgy. Tagumpay which was also attended by the representatives from the DENR, PCSD, and the municipality. It was convened that there will be an IEC to be conducted by January 2023 regarding solid waste segregation and strict implementation of the ordinance about solid wastes. Ms. Tupasi asked Mr. De Guia which initiative the said activity was. Mr. De Guia stated that it was a joint venture with Calamianes Resiliency Network which was an NGO, PCSD, DENR, the local government, and the barangays.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. commented that the Ten-Year Action Plan was too general and there must be more detailed activities related to this. He also suggested having the trash bins to be strategically located and properly marked in Coron. Ms. Tupasi clarified that the Action Plan was formulated by the Governing Board and was initially drafted by Interim Secretary which was the EMB MIMAROPA. Once the Action Plan has been approved by the Governing Board, the LGU will prepare its Compliance Scheme. However, due to two (2) administrations already elapsed, the Compliance Scheme was not comprehensively executed. During the administration of Mayor Barracoso, the Action Plan was just being formulated. The completion and implementation of the Action Plan took place during the administration of Mayor Reves.

In the administration of Mayor Reyes, it was proposed to have garbage bins in every corner of Coron. Ms. Tupasi also agreed that the Ten-Year Action Plan was broad, and the specific activities were supposed to be reflected in the Compliance Scheme, however, the activities were not laid out in writing in the Compliance Scheme. She also stated that were progress reports about these activities which can be presented to the board if they wanted to.

 Engr. Cabrestante Jr. pointed out the cluttered objectives in the plan and also suggested that the Action Plan must be realistic, attainable, and practical which can be easily implemented by the barangay and NGOs. Ms. Tupasi agreed with the cluttered Action Plan and committed to arranging the Action Plan accordingly. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. also stated that the governing board will also help in the preparing and organizing of the Action Plan.



H. Presentation of the Water Quality Status of Coron Bay

Ms. Dumenden proceeded in presenting the water quality status of Coron Bay. All monitoring stations in Coron Bay failed the Water Quality Guidelines for fecal coliform, Temperature, and dissolved oxygen. The parameters such as the Total Suspended Solids, Phosphates, Color, Nitrates, and pH passed the WQG.

Mr. Fernandez, Jr. asked about the possible reason for the rise in the water temperature aside the climate change. Ms. Tupasi answered that the pollutants from the discharged untreated and partially treated wastewater can react to the ambient water and can result in high temperatures.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. requested to study the reasons for the low concentration of dissolved oxygen which could affect the aquatic organisms. Mr. Karl Alexander Dammay, Chief EMS of Coron clarified that the stations of Tagumpay, Bakawan, and Comesaria are within the residential areas, and it was observed in every sampling conducted in the morning that the water was turbid and sometimes smelled of excrement. There was also the presence of solid waste and boats.

 Engr. Cabrestante Jr. recommended incorporating the problem of the lack of sanitary toilets of these informal settlers in the Action Plan. Mr. Fernandez, Jr. added that this residential area has houses built on stilts in the water and has direct discharges on the bay. Mr. De Guia also added that there was already a relocation site in Bakawan, however, its execution will take a long time.

> Ms. Tupasi started to conduct a re-identification of the sampling stations for the coastal and the previously identified outfalls. Mr. Dammay requested to add another station in Sitio Bayo-Bayo, in front of Siete Pecados. Ms. Tupasi agreed to look into it and will request the map of Coron which the reclamation site was also presented. Mr. De Guia added that they will also build a laboratory together with STP.

It was agreed that the tentative date for the next governing meeting was on the second week of February.

I. Agreements/Approved/Proposals Made during the Meeting

Concerned BENB WQMA Governing	Agreements/Proposals
Board Member	
CRWSA	Allowing the commissioning of the Medium-Scale STP of
	CRWSA to determine the efficiency of the STP.
BENB WQMA GB	Revision and/or re-arrangement of the Ten-Year Action Plan of
	Coron Bay WQMA
BENB WQMA Secretariat	Re-identification of the sampling stations for the coastal and
	previously identifies outfalls.





Prepared by: Reviewed by: ENGR. MA. KIMBERLY B. EVORA JANE T. DUMENDEN BENB WQMA Secretariat BENB WQMA Secretariat **EMED Technical Staff** Head, Ambient Water Attested by: MAEVELYN KATHRYN D. TUPASI BENB WQMA Secretariat OIC, AMTSS **Noted by:** ENGR. PABLITO M. ESTORQUE JR. Chief, EMED