



**4TH QUARTER GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF BACUIT – EL NIDO BAY WATER QUALITY
MANAGEMENT AREA (BENB WQMA)**

Minutes of Meeting

Date: 05 December 2022

Time Started: 9:30 AM

Venue: Virtual Meeting via Microsoft Teams

ATTENDEES

Present

Represented by

Bacuit – El Nido Bay WQMA Governing Board Members

1. Dir. Seville D. David Jr., CESO III	NWRB	Nathan L. Tambobong
2. Dir. Niño Rey C. Estoya	PCSD	Madrono Cabrestante Jr.
3. Dir. Niño Rey C. Estoya	PCSD	Apollo V. Regalo
4. Dir. Niño Rey C. Estoya	PCSD	Luna Mae A. Gemina
5. RED Lormelyn E. Claudio	DENR MIMAROPA	Conrado M. Corpuz
6. RD Beviene G. Malateo	DOT MIMAROPA	Faye Angeli Reyes
7. RD Karl Ceasar R. Rimando, CESO III	DILG MIMAROPA	Melissa Magbanua
8. RD Gerald A. Pacanan	DPWH MIMAROPA	Archimedes P. Pineda
9. RD Gerald A. Pacanan	DPWH MIMAROPA	Wylene Valencia
10. RD Gerald A. Pacanan	DPWH MIMAROPA	Lydia Lava
11. RD Ma. Josefina P. Albay	DOST MIMAROPA	Pacifico Sariago, III
12. RD Ma. Josefina P. Albay	DOST MIMAROPA	Katherine Dula
13. RD Ma. Josefina P. Albay	DOST MIMAROPA	Noel Samudio
14. RD Agustin C. Mendoza	NEDA MIMAROPA	Pamela L. De Torres
15. RD Dunstan T. San Vicente	DHSUD MIMAROPA	Ray Guarnes
16. RD Dunstan T. San Vicente	DHSUD MIMAROPA	Louis Frederic Alconcel
17. PASu Mildred A. Suza	ENTMRPA PAMO	Steven John Andao
18. Gov. Victorino Dennis M. Socrates	Office of the Governor	Leila Dagot
19. Hon. Edna G. Lim	Office of the Mayor	Fransel Oscar Dela Cruz
20. Belle Florendo	El Nido Chamber of Commerce	
21. Prince Mark Buefano	Municipal Economic Enterprise and Development Office	
22. John Michael Publico	El Nido Sewerage and Solid Waste Treatment Plant	
23. Nysceloida Valmoria	El Nido Sewerage and Solid Waste Treatment Plant	

EMB MIMAROPA Personnel

24. Edna S. Velasco	PEMU – Palawan
25. Nicaith Trisha Enrile	Chief EMS, El Nido
26. Rio Reyes	Environmental Monitoring Officer
27. Engr. Pablito M. Estorque, Jr.	OIC, Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Division
28. Atty. Alessa May Ismael	Chief, Legal Unit
29. Maevelyn Kathryn D. Tupasi	BENB WQMA Secretariat
30. Jane T. Dumenden	BENB WQMA Secretariat
31. Adz Hazen M. Dimapilis	BENB WQMA Secretariat
32. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora	BENB WQMA Secretariat



Representatives from the following agency/office members were unable to attend the meeting:

1. Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR)
2. Department of Health (DOH)
3. Department of Trade and Industry (DTI)
4. Fisheries and Aquatic Resources Management Council (FARMC)
5. Association of Barangay Captains (ABC)
6. Local Academe / DepED Division of Palawan
7. Duly registered Non-Government Organization/Local People's Organization/Civil Society involved in Natural Resource Management or Environment Concerns

Guest:

1. CGS ENS Yves Moreno Philippine Coast Guard – El Nido

BENB WQMA Members	:	22 members
Number of Members Present	:	15 members
Number of Members Absent	:	07 members

PROCEEDINGS:

A. Call To Order

The BENB WQMA Governing Board Meeting officially started at 9:30 AM. The meeting started with an opening prayer led by Ms. Ma. Kimberly B. Evora, BENB WQMA Secretariat. The presence of the attendees of the meeting was acknowledged by Mr. Adz Hazen M. Dimapilis, BENB WQMA Secretariat.

The quorum was achieved by having a total of sixteen (15) governing board members present during the meeting.

B. Presentation of the Provisional Agenda

Ms. Maevelyn Kathryn D. Tupasi, BENB WQMA Secretariat presented the following Provisional Agenda of the meeting:

1. Presentation / Approval of the Minutes from the Previous Meeting
2. Updates on the Issues and Concerns Arising During the Previous Meeting
3. Presentation of the Minutes from the Special Meeting with El Nido STP
4. Finalization of the Governing Rules
5. Presentation of the Latest Water Quality Status of Bacuit – El Nido Bays, and other Waterbodies within BENB WQMA
6. Other Matters: Presentation of the Philippine Coast Guard regarding the Oil Spill in Bacuit Bay

The Provisional Agenda for the meeting was moved and seconded by the governing board members.

C. Presentation of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

Ms. Evora proceeded with the presentation of the minutes of the previous meeting. Engr. Madrono Cabrestante Jr. from Palawan Council for Sustainable Development (PCSD) suggested revising the arrangement of the attendees presented in the minutes. The minutes of the meeting were presented by page. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. inquired why the Philippine Coast Guard was not a formal member of the BENB WQMA GB, as they have an important role in the BENB WQMA. Ms. Tupasi stated that if there is a need for the reconstitution of the governing board members, the board can recommend the amendment of the DAO. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. suggested having the presiding chair be the signatory for the approval of the minutes. He added that RD Joe Amil M. Salino must be reflected as the signatory in the minutes.



The approval of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting was moved by Engr. Cabrestante Jr. and seconded by governing board members.

D. Updates on the Issues and Concerns Arising during the Previous Meeting

Ms. Evora presented the issues and concerns arising during the previous meeting which includes the (1) Cluster Tanks near Caalan Beach and Gawad Kalinga, (2) Adjacent line layout of sewer and water of MEEDO and El Nido STP (3) Designation of ENCCI as the only representative for the Business Sector (4) Revision of Governing Rules (5) Oil Spill Incident in Bacuit Bay.

E. Presentation of the Minutes from the Special Meeting with El Nido STP

Ms. Evora also presented the Minutes from the Special Meeting with El Nido STP. The Special Meeting was conducted last October 2022 to discuss the updates, issues, and concerns on the El Nido STP. There were minor corrections made by Engr. John Michael Pablico of El Nido Sewerage and Solid Wastes Treatment Plant.

F. Finalization of the Governing Rules

Ms. Tupasi proceeded in presenting the Governing Rules of the Bacuit – El Nido Bay WQMA. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. raised his concern regarding *Section 4. Coverage*, in which the stated coverage includes the whole municipality of El Nido, Palawan. Engr. Estorque Jr. suggested showing the map of the BENB WQMA. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. stated that based on the map included in the DAO, the BENB WQMA can be seen only on the west coast of El Nido. Ms. Tupasi discussed the boundary control points of the BENB WQMA stipulated in *DENR AO No. 2021-44*.

Atty. Alessa May Ismael of EMB MIMAROPA suggested indicating only the first sentence in *Section 4* which quotes “...area coverage of BENB WQMA described in *Section 2 of DAO No. 2021-44 issued on December 23, 2021.*”

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. asked if the representative from the Local Academe of El Nido was identified. Ms. Tupasi stated that they have already convened with the local academe, however, despite the letters sent, there was no response given at their end. Ms. Tupasi agreed to Eng. Cabrestante Jr. suggestion about convening the campuses and/or universities within the area if the DepED still remains unresponsive.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. also suggested in *Section 8.1. Policy Functions (d)* to have the Provincial Government a copy furnished in the Dissemination of the WQMA Action Plan. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. suggested revising *Section 9. Termination of Board Membership*. Atty. Ismael-Habal clarified that the Termination indicated in the said section only refers to the authorized representative of the governing board and not the actual agency/organization. It was also clarified that members such as the local academe and the civil society will choose among themselves who will be the representative in the governing board. EnP. Ray Guarnes from the DHSUD MIMAROPA recommended using “*Replacement of Board Membership*” instead of “*Termination of Board Membership*”. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. added to indicate the nomination process under *Section 9*, particularly the members stated in numbers: (6) and (8) of *Section 6.1*. Atty. Ismael-Habal agreed to revise *Section 9* into *Termination and Replacement of Board Membership*.

In addition, Engr. Cabrestate Jr. asked for clarification regarding the Sectoral Committees and indicated utilizing the same terminologies stated in the DAO. The Sectoral Committee stated in *Section 11. The Executive Committee* has been revised accordingly.

The PCSD has signified its interest to be added as a member of *Section 12.2. Infrastructure Development Committee*, and *Section 12.3. Community Affairs and Development Committee*.



Engr. Cabrestante Jr. requested for the El Nido Chamber of Commerce Inc. (ENNCI) to chair the Community Affairs and Development Committee, as the teachers from the Local Academe are occupied with their own work. The chairman of the said committee was tentatively changed as requested.

Enp. Guarnes asked for clarification regarding *Section 10. Technical Secretariat*. He asked if there is a basis for adding an Environmental Engineer as one of the Technical Secretariat, or if it was supposed to be Environmental Planner. Ms. Tupasi replied that it was acquired and based on the *RA 9275: Clean Water Act of 2004* which was supported by Atty. Ismael-Habal.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. asked if there is a basis for the provision of 15% of the annual AQWFM disbursements to support the EMB MIMAROPA Region activities falling in the (a) to (f) of *Section 14.3. Uses of the AQWFM*, as the AQWFM might be depleted. Ms. Tupasi clarified that the said provision to the EMB MIMAROPA is limited to the activities stated in (a) to (f) of *Section 14.3. Uses of the AQWFM*. In addition, there was already a training workshop regarding the utilization of the AQWFM in which the relative document will be provided to the board. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. added if the concerned statement under *Section 14.3. Uses of the AQWFM* can be revised without making the provision compulsory. Ms. Tupasi stated that she will ascertain first the guidelines for the utilization of the AQWFM before finalizing the revision in the said section.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. requested to add the grants referred to in *Section 5. Other Functions of the DAO 2021-44* on the provisions under *Section 18. Support from DENR/EMB, LGU, and Other Stakeholders*.

G. Presentation of the Latest Water Quality Status of Bacuit – El Nido Bays, and other Waterbodies within BENB WQMA

Ms. Jane T. Dumenden, BENB WQMA Secretariat presented the water quality results in the Bacuit and El Nido Bays for CY 2022. In terms of *fecal coliform* concentration in the coastal station of Bacuit Bay, station 1. Masagana failed to meet the Water Quality Guidelines (WQG). Parameters such as dissolved oxygen, phosphates, and nitrates have passed the WQG, however, station 1. Masagana and station 3. Buena Suerte exceeds the WQG in terms of total suspended solids.

Ms. Dumenden also presented the water quality for the monitored outfalls within the BENB WQMA. All stations of the monitored outfalls failed the WQG for *fecal coliform* and dissolved oxygen. In terms of pH, only station 3. Masagana Outfall I and station 5. Masagana Outfall II failed the set WQG.

The water quality of the tourist destinations was also presented by Ms. Dumenden. The monitored parameters in the tourist destinations were *fecal coliform*, dissolved oxygen, and pH, which all passed the WQG.

In addition, El Nido Bay was also monitored for its water quality status. In terms of *fecal coliform*, dissolved oxygen, phosphates, nitrates, and pH, all of it passed the WQG.

However, most monitoring stations of El Nido Bay (Stn. 3 LiO Runway, Stn. 4 LiO Port, Stn. 5 LiO Beach, Stn. 6 Lamuro, Stn. 8 Twin Beach, Stn. 9 Nacpan Port, and Stn. 10 Nacpan Beach) failed to meet the WQG in terms of total suspended solids.

Ambient monitoring regarding the failed Oil and Grease concentration in Bacuit Bay on June 27 and August 1, 2022 relative to the filed complaint was also presented to the board.

As requested by the governing board, maps of the monitoring stations were also presented and discussed by Ms. Tupasi at the governing board meeting.

Engr. Nysceloida Valmoria from the El Nido Sewerage and Solid Waste Treatment Plant discussed the status of the connectivity in the El Nido STP. She stated that there were already fifty-three (53) establishments connected



and hopefully by January it will be increased as the connectivity to the El Nido STP was already a requirement for the renewal of the business permit. She also stated that they were able to operate in the Caalan, Buena Suerte, and Masagana. Ms. Tupasi clarified if the drainage outfalls are still not able to connect as one of the collecting tanks in the Mangrove Area is still not operational. Engr. Valmoria added that the area of Corong-corong was not able to cater due to the raised problem.

Ms. Belle Florendo from the El Nido Chamber of Commerce (ENCCI) asked Engr. Valmoria on how often they monitor the cluster tanks as there were leaks in the Caalan last November 19. Engr. Valmoria clarified that it was the pipes instead of the cluster tanks that had leaks and that they already reported the incident to the LGU. She also added that they were able to solve the problem within that day and it was working as of the meeting's date. They also added deodorizers to the area to lift the smell caused by the wastewater.

Engr. John Michael Publico also from the El Nido Sewerage and Solid Waste Treatment Plant added that they already have a monitoring team to monitor their operational cluster collecting tank. Ms. Florendo asked the representative from the El Nido STP if they have try to convince the business establishment to connect. Engr. Valmoria added that they were already finalizing their letter as of the meeting's date to remind the establishments to connect.

The *fecal coliform* trend from 2017 to 2021 was also presented at the meeting, in which the CY 2020 shows the highest concentration measured, which was concluded to be caused by the residential areas in El Nido, Palawan.

EnP. Guarnes asked if the LGU El Nido already requires the three-chamber septic tank in the building permit. Mr. Steven John Andao from the ENTMRPA PAMO commented they already require it in the PAMB and engineering office of the LGU. Ms. Florendo also added that the DOT also requires the septic tank inspection report from the engineering office.

H. Other Matters: Presentation of the Philippine Coast Guard regarding the Oil Spill in Bacuit Bay

CGS ENS Yves Moreno from the Philippine Coast Guard – El Nido presented the Oil Spill Incident that transpired on 21 June 2022 which was posted by Mr. Tani Distal in the social media. He stated that upon receiving the complaint, the PCG – El Nido immediately deployed their personnel to conduct an inspection to determine the veracity of the complaint. However, upon arrival in the area, the said oil spill left no trace, thus the said verification yielded a negative result due to the non-existence of the said oil spill in the area. The deployment was on about 1300H of the same date, one (1) hour after the photo was posted by the concerned citizen.

The red motorbanka captured from the posted photo near the alleged oil spill incident was requested to give a statement for the possible involvement of their motorbanka, however, the crew denied their motorbanka's involvement and stated that they are aware of the existing policies and guidelines of the proper discharge and disposal of waste fuel.

CGS ENS Moreno also presented their letter to Mr. Benly Lim, the president of the El Nido Pump Boat Owners Association (ENPOA) pertaining to the said incident as well as their reply letter to Ms. Nicaith Enrile, chief EMS of El Nido.

Ms. Florendo clarified that the current president of the ENPOA was Ms. Elizabeth Panganiban. Engr. Cabrestante Jr. clarified if the said oil spill was false. CGS ENS Moreno replied the said complaint based on the photo was real, however, after an hour, it was already dissolved and dispersed.

Engr. Cabrestante Jr. recommended in instances like this, the board can immediately send someone from the MSG to take water samples so that the acquired information was backed by scientific data.



CGS ENS Moreno stated the concern of the Station Commander of El Nido regarding the gross tonnages were not covered in the PCG Memorandum Circular 06 – 2005 and they are currently working on the revision of the policy in order to endorse it to the LGU in addressing such issue.

I. Agreements/Approved/Proposals Made during the Meeting

Concerned BENB WQMA Governing Board Member	Agreements/Proposals
BENB WQMA Secretariat	Convening the campuses and/or universities within the area for the representative of the Local Academe
	Circulation of the documents/guidelines relative to the utilization of the AQWMF.

The meeting adjourned at 3:20 PM.

Prepared by:

ENGR. MA. KIMBERLY B. EVORA
BENB WQMA Secretariat

Reviewed by:

JANE T. DUMENDEN
BENB WQMA Secretariat
Head, Ambient Water

Attested by:

MAEVELYN KATHRYN D. TUPASI
BENB WQMA Secretariat
OIC, AMTSS

Noted by:

ENGR. PABLITO M. ESTORQUE JR.
OIC, Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Division