

Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting  
Zoom Conference Meeting ID No. 822 0510 2842  
4 August 2023

**1. Call to Order.** Ms. Katherine Custodio, WWF-Philippines, presided over the meeting. After determining that there was a quorum, the meeting was called to order at 3:25 pm.

Present:

1. Ms. Katherine Custodio, WWF-Phils	Presiding Officer
2. Hon. Sergio Tapalla, LGU-Cag	Member
3. Ms. Ma. Elizabeth Sabando, PGP	Member
4. Ms. Angelica Querubin, Saguda-Palawan	Member
5. LTC Isagani G Nato, WesCom	Member
6. CG Capt. Antolin R Cayabo, CGD-Pal	Member
7. Ms. Rhodora Ubani, DENR-PENRO	Member

Absent:

1. Commo Alan M. Javier PN, NFW	Member
2. Mr. Niño Estoya, PCSDS	Member

Guest:

- 1. Atty. Sarah Diva, PCSDS
- 2. Atty. Crystal Bernardo, PCSDs
- 3. Mr. Jico Eguarras, DENR MIMAROPA-CDD-PAMBC

**2.2 International Ranger Award 2023.** The World Conservation Institute nominated the four TMO rangers for the 2023 ranger award: Segundo Conales, Jr., Noel Bundal, Jeffrey David, and Cresencio Caranay, Jr. They represented the Philippine Navy, Philippine Coast Guard, and Municipality of Cagayancillo personnel because they are the only full-time rangers assigned in Tubbataha. The prize of US\$10,000.00 to fund projects chosen by the rangers accompanies the award. This will be used to purchase efficient batteries for the solar panels in the park, among other things.

The members of the Executive Committee congratulated TMO and the rangers for the award.

**2.3 COA AOM 2023-001-(2002), Cash and Property Accountabilities.** The Presiding Officer recognized Atty. Sarah Diva and Atty. Crystal Bernardo of PCSDS to shed light on the matter. Atty. Diva informed the Committee that PCSDS was copied in COA Audit Observation Memo 2023-001-(2000) addressed to the PASu, and Attention to Ms. Barber of TMO and Executive Director Estoya of PCSDS. She recommended that a consolidated management comment be submitted to the COA with all three signatories by Monday, 7 August 2023, which is the deadline for responding to the AOM.

The PASu explained that TMO is still to complete the documents for submission to the OP and DBM and that the Office is looking for a consultant to guide the process. This matter will be expressed in the response. Atty. Diva said that her office will send the draft response to TMO and will send the final copy to TMO for signatures on the 7<sup>th</sup>.

**2.4 LGU Tourism Share.** The share of Cagayancillo in tourism revenues for 2023 is One Million Six Hundred Fifty-Two Thousand and Five Hundred Seventy-Five Pesos

(Php1,652,575.00). The Committee agreed that the fund be released to the Municipality after the submission of a fund utilization report and a proposal for the use of the 2023 share.

**2.5 DBP Payroll Agreement.** The PASu informed the Committee that the Payroll Servicing Agreement with the DBP is about to expire and that a renewal of the Agreement is due. She asked the Committee for the authority to sign the Agreement to renew the ATM payroll services of DBP. The Committee decided to bring the matter up to the TPAMB for decision.

**2.6 Enforcement Update, Isaiah-2.** Ms. Valenzuela, TMO, reported that the four (4) fishers apprehended in Tubbataha on 13 June 2023 were committed to the Provincial Jail on 26 June. They were released on bail on 30 June. The arraignment and pre-trial will be held on 15 August 2023.

**2.7 Amendment of TAB Rules and AO#1.** The PASu recalled that during the diving season, the TAB recognized that there is a need to review and amend the TAB Rules of Procedure. The amendment may also affect Administrative Order No. 1, hence, the latter will also be reviewed. She requested the Committee, especially PCSDS, to attend the review in September 2023.

The members agreed to participate in the review. The schedule will be finalized based on the availability of the participants.

**2.8 METT Assessment Presentation.** Asst. PASu Retch Alaba presented the results of the participatory evaluation using the Management Effectiveness Tracking Tool 4 (METT-4) conducted on 31 August 2022 with 32 participants. Management evaluation aims to assess how well-protected areas are being managed and the extent to which management is protecting the values and achieving goals and objectives.

TMO has used various tools to measure management effectiveness throughout the years. To be consistent with other PAs, TMO will use the METT-4 tool, which will be administered every three years, as per DENR guidance.

Of the 13 threats listed in the METT, 8 apply to Tubbataha. These are 1) international shipping due to the potential for oil spill and grounding incidents, 2) illegal fishing, 3) impacts of tourism, 4) invasive and non-native species 5) marine debris, 6) erosion in Bird Islet, 7) climate change (habitat shifts on the reefs, coral bleaching, ocean acidification, sea level rise), and 8) unclear institutional standing of TMO.

The highest rating of 100% was garnered for 'planning' and the lowest was in 'input' (75%) due to the park's heavy dependence on external sources. Tubbataha got a management effectiveness score of 90% for 2023. The members of the Committee congratulated TMO for the high METT score.

**2.9 ADB Project.** The PASu recalled that the Executive Committee passed Resolution No. 21-129 'Requesting Asian Development Bank (ADB) through its Environment Thematic Group (ETG) and Finance Sector Group (FSG), to Include the Tubbataha Reefs in the Project "Partnership in Coral Reef Finance and Insurance in Asia and the Pacific" (supported by ADB and Global Environment Facility)' dated 24 September 2021. The ADB consultant, Dr. Hilly Quiaoit requested an expression of interest from TMO. The PASu inquired whether PCSDS is supporting the project before responding to the request.

Atty. Diva said that she is unaware of the stand of PCSDS on the project and will inquire from the office concerned before responding to the PASu.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:30 pm.

Prepared by:

  
**ANGELIQUE M. SONGCO**  
Secretary

Attested by:

  
**KATHERINE CUSTODIO**  
Presiding Officer