

Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

MEMORANDUM

FOR :

The In-Charge, Office of the Director

Forest Management Bureau

Visayas Avenue, Diliman, 1100 Quezon City

THRU

The Regional Executive Director

DENR-MIMAROPA Region

1515 DENR By the Bay Building, Roxas Boulevard,

Barangay 668, Ermita, Manila

The OIC, Assistant Regional Director for Technical Services

FROM

The Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Officer

SUBJECT

COMPLAINT AGAINST CORON WATERSHED BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION-COMMUNITY BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBWA-CBFM) IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR ALLEGED CONDONING OF HILEGAL FOREST ACTIVITYEES

CONDONING OF ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES

Please be informed that the memorandum dated February 22, 2023 from PENRO Palawan enclosed the memorandum dated February 21, 2023 of the Investigating Team in relation to PENRO Special Order No. 2023-016 series of 2023 issued on February 1, 2023 with a subject "Creation of investigating team to the complaint against Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association-Community-Based Forest Management (CWBA-CBFM) in CENRO Coron, Palawan for alleged condoning of illegal forest activities" were already forwarded to the DENR MIMAROPA Regional Office

Further, the Investigating Team conducted the validation and investigation on February 17 to 20, 2023 at the CBFM area of Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association (CWBA) Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative (AMPC) at Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan and the corresponding report was duly submitted to our Regional Office with the subject "COMPLETED STAFF WORK (CSW) ON THE COMPLAINT AGAINST CORON WATERSHED BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION (CWBA) AGRO-FORESTRY MULTI-PURPOSE COOPERATIVE (AMPC) – COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBFM) [CWBA AMPC-CBFM] IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR ALLEGED CONDONING OF ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES [E-2023-101414]" (please see attached said memoranda)

For information and record.

FELIZARDO B. CAYATOC

DEN February 23, 2023

DATS NO.

RECESTION

RECORDS SEC

☐ INCOMING ☐ OUTGOING

BY:

TIME:

Copy Furnished CENRO Coron, Palawan

File/2023-008/Investigation Report to the Complaint from Violeta Mosquera Abaca/ACG MES Doc/Ref. No. 2023-1540

DENR-PALAWAN
PENRO-RECORDS

RELEASED

By
Date: 28 FEB 2020, 23-491

Sprin

Email Address: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

DOCUMENT ACTION INFORMATION FORM

Doc. Ref. No.: 2023-1520

Date and Time received:

02/22/2023 08:12:05 am

From: ELIZALDE M. SEGUNDO, ET.AL

Document Type:

Memorandums

Subject: COMPLETED STAFF WORK (CSW) ON THE COMPLAINT AGAINST CORON WATERSHED BENEFECIARIES ASSOCIATION (CWBA) AGRO-FORESTRY MULTI-PURPOSE COOPERATIVE (AMPC)-COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBFM) (CWBA-AMPC-CBFM) IN CEMRO CROON, PALAWAN FOR ALLEGED CONDONING OF

Attachment(s): ANNEX A, ATTENDANCE SHEET A	AND PERT DOCS	Earmarked As :
Date: 02-72 From:	PEVMO	TO: TSD-MES and CBFOS
Action Recommended/Required: For Action For Approval For Information, Recommendation For Disbursement/ Payment For Official Release For Signature For Signature For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommended/Required: For Information, Recommended/Required: For Review/ Recommendation For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommended/Required: For Signature For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Information Information Information For Information Information Information For Information Infor	Processing Time: Urgent (w/in the day) Priority (w/in 3 days) Complex	Other Instruction(s): Forward actors
Date: From:		То:
Action Recommended/Required: For Action For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Disbursement/ Payment For Official Release For Signature For Signature For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Information, Recommendation Recommendation Recommended/Required:	Priority (w/in 3 days) Complex w/in 7 days	Other Instruction(s):
Date: From:	ennemendrody many pumino des establishens seens en un trom de de nationales authorises establishens en de secu	Τα
Action Recommended/Required: For Action For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Disbursement/ Payment For Official Release For Signature For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Information, Recommended/Required: For Information, Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Information, Recommendation Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Information, Recommendation Recommendation For Information, Recommenda	Priority (w/in 3 days) Complex	Other Instruction(s):
Date: From:		То:
Action Recommended/Required: For Action For Approval For Information, Recommendation For Disbursement/ Payment For Official Release For Signature For Signature For Review/ Recommendation For Information, Recommendation For Indorsement to concerned Party(ies) Return to Payee/Sen	Priority (w/in 3 days) Complex w/in 7 days	Other Instruction(s):



Republic of the Philippines Department of Environment and Natural Resources FOREST MANAGEMENT BUREAU

Visayas Avenue, Diliman, 1100 Quezon City Tel. No.: (632) 892

5-2141 / (632) 8927-4788

Reference of Research E-mail Address

MEMORANDUM

TO

The Regional Executive Director

DENR Region IV-B (MIMAROPA)

ATT'N. Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Officer

(PENRO) - Palawan and

Community Environment and Natural Resources Officer CENRO)

- Coron

Attorney IV, Office of the Director FROM

In-Charge, Office of the Director

SUBJECT COMPLAINT AGAINST CORON WATERSHED

> BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION - COMMUNITY BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBWA-CBFM) IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR ALLEGED CONDONING OF

ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES

DATE

FEB 17 2023

This pertains to the Memorandum of Atty. Juan Miguel T. Cuna, Undersecretary for Field Operations - Luzon, Visayas and Environment to you dated 13 January 2023 about the Complaint Against Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association - Community Based Forest Management in Cenro Coron, Palawan for Alleged Condoning of Illegal Forest Activities of which this Office was copy furnished.

In his Memorandum, he referred to you the subject Complaint for verification, and furnish his Office and parties concerned of the actions taken citing the document tracking number DENR CO-OSEC 2023-000118 for monitoring and record purposes.

In this regard, please evaluate this Complaint and conduct immediate investigation in coordination with Ms. Violeta Abaca, Leader of KPTSN of Coron, Palawan, and submit a Completed Staff Work (CSW) to the Office of the Undersecretary for Field Operations - Luzon, Visayas and Environment and copy furnish this Office within a week after the conduct of the investigation.

FOR INFORMATION AND CONSIDERATION, PLEASE.

Ray Thomas

Cc: Atty. Juan Miguel T. Cuna, CESO I Undersecretary for Field Operations - Luzon, Visayas and Environment

Ms. Violeta Mosquera Abaca Leader of KPSTN - Coron, Palawan violetaabaca81@gmail.com



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

February 22, 2023

MEMORANDUM

FOR

The Regional Executive Director

DENR-MIMAROPA Region

1515 DENR By the Bay Building, Roxas Boulevard,

Barangay 668, Ermita, Manila

THRU

The OIC, Assistant Regional Director for Technical Services

FROM

The Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Officer

SUBJECT

COMPLETED STAFF WORK (CSW) ON THE COMPLAINT AGAINST

CORON WATERSHED BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION

(CWBA) AGRO-FORESTRY MULTI-PURPOSE COOPERATIVE (AMPC) – COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBFM)

[CWBA AMPC-CBFM] IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR

ALLEGED CONDONING OF ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES [E-2023-

101414]

Respectfully forwarded the memorandum dated February 21, 2023 from the Investigating Team in relation to PENRO Special Order No. 2023-016 series of 2023 issued on February 1, 2023 with a subject "Creation of investigating team to the complaint against Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association-Community-Based Forest Management (CWBA-CBFM) in CENRO Coron, Palawan for alleged condoning of illegal forest activities."

Per memorandum, the Investigating Team conducted the validation and investigation on February 17 to 20, 2023 at the CBFM area of Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association (CWBA) Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative (AMPC) at Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan. The result of investigation disclosed that pieces of evidence had been gathered including all the required information collected during interviews which manifested and will serve as proof that the complaint is purely malicious in nature and nasty allegations. Therefore, the team recommended the following:

- 1. The investigating team recommended that series of activities will be conducted for the resolution of the stated boundary conflict between CBFM area and private lots with land titles within Unclassified Public Forest (UPF) surrounded in the CBFM jurisdiction; and
- 2. The Officers and Members of the CBFM CWBA Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative in partnership of the CENRO Coron need to continue their good deeds for the conservation and protection of the CBFM area and to the environment as a whole.

Further, Mrs. Violeta Mosquera Abaca requested to the investigating team to make research who made the unsigned complaint through email in order to give justice in her name. Likewise, the Chairperson of the CBFM PO Mrs. Consuelo T. Magallanes also requested the team if who made the email and to determine the personality beyond the said email complaint that really besmirched and/or destroyed them.

For information and further instruction.

FELIZARDO B. CAYATOC

Copy Furnished
CENRO Coron, Palawan
File/2023-004/Investigation Report to the Complaint from

File/2023-004/Investigation Report to the Complaint from Violeta Mosquera Abaca/ACG MES Doc. Ref. No. 2023-1520

THROUGH E-MAIL

EMAILED TO: RED CC: ARD IS and CENED

E-MAILED BY: XYPX

DATE:2

FEB 2023 IME: 8:40 PM

COVOY

DENR-PALAWAN
PENRO-RECORDS
RELEASED

BY 77 FEB 2023 23-46



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

February 21, 2023

DENR PENRO

PALAWAN RECORDS

MEMORANDUM

FOR

The Provincial Environment and

Natural Resources Officer

FROM

The Undersigned

SUBJECT

COMPLETED STAFF WORK (CSW) ON THE COMPLAINT AGAINST

CORON WATERSHED BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION

(CWBA) AGRO-FORESTRY MULTI-PURPOSE COOPERATIVE (AMPC) – COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBFM)

[CWBA AMPC-CBFM] IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR

ALLEGED CONDONING OF ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES [E-2023-

101414]

Respectfully submitted the Completed Staff Work (CSW) dated February 21, 2023 from the Investigating Team in relation to PENRO Special Order No. 2023-016 series of 2023 issued on February 1, 2023 with a subject "Creation of investigating team to the complaint against Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association-Community-Based Forest Management (CWBA-CBFM) in CENRO Coron, Palawan for alleged condoning of illegal forest activities."

The undersigned conducted the validation and investigation on February 17 to 20, 2023 at the CBFM area of Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association (CWBA) Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative (AMPC) at Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan. The result of investigation disclosed that pieces of evidence have been gathered including all the required information collected during interviews which manifested and will serve as proof that the complaint is purely malicious in nature and unwarranted allegations.

For information, record and further instruction.

ELIZALDE M'SEGUNDO

Forest Technician II/Member Chief, Forest Protection Unit

DENR CENRO Coron

MARK GLENNT. MANAGDAG

ECOMS II/Member

Chief, Compliance Monitoring Unit DENR CENRO Coron

QUERUBIN G. WOINTANA

Forester WMember

Chief, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

DENR CENRO Coron

MERLYN L. BLAZA

CDO II/Assistant Team Leader Focal Person, CBFM/FLUP DENR PENRO Palawan ARNEL C. GAMUTIA

Forester II/Team Leader
OIC, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

DENR PENRO Palawan



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791 Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

COMPLETED STAFF WORK (CSW)

I. SUBJECT:

COMPLAINT AGAINST CORON WATERSHED BENEFICIARIES ASSOCIATION (CWBA) AGRO-FORESTRY MULTI-PURPOSE COOPERATIVE (AMPC) – COMMUNITY-BASED FOREST MANAGEMENT (CBFM) [CWBA AMPC-CBFM] IN CENRO CORON, PALAWAN FOR ALLEGED CONDONING OF ILLEGAL FOREST ACTIVITIES [E-2023-101414]

II. FACTS OF THE CASE/BACKGROUND:

This case stemmed from the electronic mail dated November 11, 2022 (Friday) more or less 8:00 in the morning from unsigned name Violeta Mosquera Abaca, a Leader of Katutubong Pamayanang Tagbanua ng San Nicolas (KPTSN). The complainant used the email address of violetaabaca81@gmail.com addressed to Office of the Secretary of DENR with email address of osec@denr.gov.ph

The said complaint states that: (Please refer to the unsigned letter of Violeta Mosquera Abaca as Annex "A")

"Violeta Abaca <u>violetaabaca81@gmail.com</u> To: osec@denr.gov.ph Fri, Nov 11, 2022 at 8:00 AM

Magandang araw po,

Ano po ang tungkulin ng CWBA CBFM sa inyong ahensya sa CENRO Coron. Sa pagkakaintindi ko po ang CBFM ay ang inyong kaagapay sa pagsulong sa mga adbokasiya na may kinalaman sa pagprotekta sa kalikasan, sa reforestation at pagkondena sa mga gawain na syang sumisira sa kalikasan katulad ng pagkakaingin, logging at pag-uuling. Bakit sila rin ang nangunguna sa pag-lalagari ng mga kahoy at sila rin ang nangunguna sa pag-sira nito at higit pa riyan ang mga pagbabakod ng mga public lands, forest areas lalo na sa Brgy. San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan. Ang mga lupa na kanilang binabakod ay pinamamahagi sa miyembro ng CWBA CBFM mga kamag-anak at ilang Kawani ng CENRO Coron. Ngunit, wala namang kapangyarihan ang CWBA CBFM mamahagi ng lupa at tinalo pa ang DAR o Department of Agrarian lalong lalo hindi naman ito ahensya ng gobyerno. Bakit inaagawan niyo ng lupain ang mga mamamayan at mga indigenous peoples. Malawak ang sabwatan sa inyong ahensya kawawa ang maliliit na tao kapag kami ang nahuli kinakasuhan kaagad bakit ito malaya sa ganitong gawain.

Imbestigahan niyo naman ito.

Violeta Mosquera Abaca Leader of KPTSN"

III. APPLICABLE LAWS/ISSUANCES

Executive Order No. 263 dated July 19, 1995 adopting Community-Based Forest Management as the national strategy to ensure the sustainable development of the country's forest land resources and providing mechanisms for its implementation;



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region
PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

Executive Order No. 23 dated February 1, 2011 declaring a Moratorium on the Cutting and Harvesting of Timber in the Natural and Residual Forests and Creating the Anti-Illegal Logging Task Force:

- Section 77 and Section 78 of PD 705, as amended dated May 19, 1975. Revising Presidential Decree No. 389, otherwise known as the Forestry Reform Code of the Philippines; and
- ➤ DENR Administrative Order No. 2022-05 dated March 09, 2022. Rules and Regulations on Wood Charcoal.

IV. AGENCIES/OFFICES INVOLVED

The DENR PENRO Palawan and CENRO Coron, Palawan will caused the execution, verification and investigation to the above-mentioned complaint addressed to the Office of the Secretary of DENR. The investigating team properly coordinated to the concerned Barangay of San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan.

Further, the team conducted coordination to the complainant and the complained party the Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association (CWBA) Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative (AFMPC) – Community-Based Forest Management (CBFM) [CWBA AFMPC-CBFM] located in CENRO Coron, Palawan for the alleged condoning of illegal forest activities. Likewise, coordination and gathering of required information to other involved individuals relative to this case. (Please refer to attendance sheet as Annex "B")

V. CHRONOLOGY OF EVENTS RELATIVE TO THE ABOVE-CITED SUBJECT PRIOR TO THE CONDUCT OF FIELD INVESTIGATION

- 1. The above-quoted complaint dated November 11, 2022 was emanated from Violita Mosquera Abaca, bearing no signature via email addressed to the Office of the Secretary of DENR;
- 2. That Augusto D. Dela Peña, Undersecretary and Officer-In-Charge, Chief of Staff, sent a letter to Ms. Violeta Mosquera Abaca acknowledging and referring the said complaint to the Undersecretary for Field Operations Luzon, Visayas and Environment for appropriate action; (Please refer to the letter to Ms. Violeta Mosquera Abaca as Annex "C")
- 3. That on January 05, 2023 Augusto D. Dela Peña, Undersecretary and Chief of Staff forwarded the issue through memorandum for the Undersecretary for Field Operations Luzon, Visayas and Environment for appropriate action; (Please refer to Memorandum dated January 05, 2023 as Annex "D")
- 4. That on January 13, 2023 Atty. Juan Miguel T. Cuna, CESO I forwarded the issue through memorandum to the Regional Executive Director of DENR MIMAROPA Region for compliant verification and further action; (Please refer to Memorandum dated January 13, 2023 as Annex "E")



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region
PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791 Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

- 5. That on January 24, 2023 Maximo C. Landrito, the OIC ARD for Technical Services referred the concern through memorandum to the Provincial Environment and Natural Resources Officer of Palawan directing to conduct investigation to the said illegal activities allegedly perpetrated by CWBA CBFM Officials/Members in coordination with the complainant and Barangay Officials of San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan. Further, requiring to submit report with categorical recommendation/s including pertinent documents within seven (7) days upon receipt to serve as basis for further action by the Regional Office; (Please refer to Memorandum dated January 13, 2023 as Annex "F")
- 6. That on February 1, 2023 PENRO Felizardo B. Cayatoc issued PENRO Special Order No. 2023-016 series of 2023 with a subject "Creation of investigating team to the complaint against Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association-Community-Based Forest Management (CWBA-CBFM) in CENRO Coron, Palawan for alleged condoning of illegal forest activities"; (Please refer to PENRO Special Order No. 2023-016 series of 2023 as Annex "G")
- 7. That on the same day February 1, 2023 PENRO Felizardo B. Cayatoc sent a memorandum for the Regional Executive Director of DENR MIMAROPA Region requesting for time extension for the submission of report with categorical recommendation/s from February 7, 2023 to be submitted on February 23, 2023 due to the reason that the investigating team have prior equally important fieldworks conducted. The investigation was conducted on February 16 to 21, 2023; (Please refer to Memorandum dated February 1, 2023 as Annex "H")

VI. ACCOMPLISHMENTS DURING INVESTIGATION AND VERIFICATION

- 1. The investigating team properly coordinated with OIC Development Management Officer IV Edwin I. Cac, In-Charge, Office of the CENRO of Coron Palawan on February 16 and 17, 2023. Likewise, coordinated to all concerned personnel for the conducted investigation of CENRO Coron, Palawan;
- 2. The investigating team properly coordinated with the Barangay Officials of San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan on February 17 and 18, 2023. Further, coordinated to the complainant and the complained party including all the identified individuals during the conduct of investigation;
- 3. The Officers and members of Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative of Community-Based Forest Management in Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan presented their Cooperative's documents, such as:
 - 3.1. List of Officers; (Please refer to List of Officers as Annex "I")
 - 3.2. List of Active and In-Active Members; (Please refer to List of Active and In-Active Members as Annex "J")
 - 3.3. Accomplishments; (Please refer to List of Accomplishments as Annex "K")
 - 3.4. Profile/Report; (Please refer to Profile/Report as Annex "L")



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region
PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791 Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

- 4. The team investigated the complaint of Violeta Mosquera Abaca on February 17, 2023 at Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan. Mrs. Violeta Mosquera Abaca mentioned that she is the Chairperson of Katutubong Pamayanang Tagbanua ng San Nicolas (KPTSN) and strongly denied the veracity and truthfulness stated in the unsigned complaint. She (Abaca) does not used computer and sent an email complaint to the Office of DENR Secretary because she does not know how to operate/use the computer. (Please refer to the Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay ni Violeta Mosquera Abaca as Annex "M") Instead, Mrs. Abaca alleged Ex-Barangay Captain of San Nicolas Joel Reyes Moreño as the one who made the said complaint due to their cancelled business transactions. On the contrary, on February 18, 2023 Former Barangay Captain of San Nicolas Hon. Joel Reves Moreño issued "Panayam Tungkol sa Pagpapatakbo ng CBFM kay Former Punong Barangay Joel R. Moreño 2010-2018" signifying all out support to the activities of the CBFM People's Organization. (Please refer to the Panayam Tungkol sa Pagpapatakbo ng CBFM kay Former Punong Barangay Joel R. Moreño 2010-2018 as Annex "N") Finally, Mrs. Abaca requested the team to make a research who made the unsigned complaint through email in order to give justice in her name;
- 5. In support to the investigation process, the team able to facilitate the issuance of Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay ni Mohammed Canuto G. Soniega, Vice Chairperson of Coron Watershed Beneficiaries Association Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative. (Please refer to the Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay ni Mohammed Canuto G. Soniega as Annex "O") Vice Chairperson Soniega supported the denial as alleged in the unsigned complaint. As such, he pointed certain Mr. Jaypee L. Pascual and Ex-Barangay Captain of San Nicolas Joel Reyes Moreño as the main personalities who made the email complaint as they also considered as regularly criticized the PO's water system project. Of which, Mr. Pascual issued "Concern and Issues with CWBA Waterworks" on February 18, 2023. (Please refer to the Concern and Issues with CWBA Waterworks as Annex "P") stating issues and concerns about the PO's water system project only and no other issues raised that are mentioned in the unsigned complaint;
- 6. Project Manager Ramil F. Malto of CBFM-Agro-Forestry prepared his Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay. (Please Loob na Salaysay ni Ramil F. Malto as Annex "Q") Mr. Malto opposes the allegations stated in the complaint except the cutting of trees made by their organization. The trees involved in the said permitted cutting were planted trees or Mangium trees that had been used in the replacement of three (3) wooden bridges at Sitios Bantad, Pinamaratan and Tabok, San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan that had been destroyed by the onslaught of typhoon Odette last December 17, 2021 (Please refer to the Certification dated February 17, 2023 issued by Incumbent Punong Barangay Jerson L. Elbat of Barangay San Nicolas as Annex "R") and (Please refer to the Geotagged Photos as Annex "S", "T" and "U") respectively;
- 7. On February 19, 2023, CBFM PO Chairperson Consuelo T. Magallanes of Purok 1, Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan issued her Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay denying all the allegations except the permitted cutting of Mangium trees. No forest trees cut in the forested area within the AOR of CBFM CWBA Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative. (Please refer to the Malaya at Kusang-Loob na Salaysay ni Consuelo T. Magallanes as Annex "V") All the allegations in the unsigned complaint are not true. In fact, Punong Barangay Jerson L. Elbat of Barangay San Nicolas, Coron, Palawan issued a Certification on February 17, 2023 stating that no illegal environmental activities being committed or existed by the members, officers of the CBFM PO and to their area of jurisdiction.



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

(Please refer to the Certification dated February 17, 2023 issued by Punong Barangay Jerson L. Elbat of Barangay San Nicolas as Annex "W") and (Please refer to the Geotagged Photos as Annex "X" and "Y") respectively.

VII. ISSUES/CONCERNS

The investigating team with full participation of the concerned individuals noted that the allegations in the unsigned complaints are not true. Pieces of evidence that have been presented herein including information gathered during interviews are proofs that the complaint is purely malicious in nature and unwarranted allegations.

In some instances, the investigating team found that may be the complaint is the result of boundary conflicts between the CBFM area and to all the concerned individuals occupied in the nearby private lots like spouses Henry and Juanita Bernel and Jesus Vicente Fernandez. As such, an exit conference had been conducted on February 20, 2023 at more or less 1:00 in the afternoon and religiously discussed the conflicting issues on boundary disputes. There are follow up activities pertaining to the said boundary conflict to be conducted soon by the personnel of CENRO Coron. (Please refer to the Letter Request of Chairperson Consuelo T. Magallanes and Attendance Sheet as Annex "Z" and "AA") respectively.

VIII. OTHER ACCOMPLISHMENTS

- 1. The investigating team able to gather the opinion and (DMO IV) Edwin I. Cac and OIC CENRO Rodney G. Verian pertaining to the letter request dated January 30, 2023 of Municipal Mayor of Coron, Palawan addressed to our DENR Secretary Ma. Antonia Yulo-Loyzaga appealing for humanitarian consideration, to consider the previous decision to lift the suspension order and to allow the Municipal Government of Coron, Palawan to push through the construction of permanent and new Coron Public Market located at Barangay Poblacion 6, Coron, Palawan. According to them, since the letter was already sent to the Secretary, they will wait for the instructions from DENR higher authorities and make request; and
- 2. The team also discussed to the Monitoring and Enforcement Personnel of CENRO Coron on February 20, 2023 more or less 2:30 P.M. relative to the issues and concerns about the implementation of environmental laws, documentation process, time and necessary legal documents for the submission of required targets and reports stipulated in the Work and Financial Plan for CY 2023. (Please refer to the Documents Discussed and Attendance Sheet as Annex "BB" and "CC") respectively.

IX. RECOMMENDATION

- 1. The investigating team recommended that series of activities will be conducted for the resolution of the stated boundary conflict between CBFM area and private lots with land titles within Unclassified Public Forest (UPF) surrounded in the CBFM jurisdiction; and
- 2. The Officers and Members of the CBFM CWBA Agro-Forestry Multi-Purpose Cooperative in partnership of the CENRO Coron need to continue their good deeds for the conservation and protection of the CBFM area and to the environment as a whole.



Department of Environment and Natural Resources

MIMAROPA Region

PROVINCIAL ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES OFFICE

Bgy. Sta. Monica, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan Telfax No. (048) 434 - 8791

Email Add: penropalawan@denr.gov.ph

Date: February 21, 2023

Prepared by:

ELIZALDE M. SEGUNDO Forest Technician II/Member Chief, Forest Protection Unit

DENR CEMRO Coron

MARK GLENN T. MANAGDAG

ECOMS II/Member

Chief, Compliance Monitoring Unit

DENR CENRO Coron

QUERUBIN COUINTANA
Forester II/Member

Chief, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

DEXR CENRO Coron

MERLYN CDO II/Assistant Team Leader

Focal Person, CBFM/FLUP **DENR PENRO Palawan**

ARNEL C. GAMUTIA

Forester II/Team Leader

OIC, Monitoring and Enforcement Section

DENR PENRO Palawan

Attested by:

ELIZARDO B. CAYATOC

PENRO